## UNIVERSITY OF NAIROBI



# INSTITUTE OF DIPLOMACY AND INTERNATIONAL STUDIES

# **RESEARCH PAPER**

# IMPACT OF CIVIL-MILITARY COOPERATION ON THE CONFLICT OF SOMALIA 2012-2016

# HUMPHREY KIMUTAI LANG'AT R47/8920/2017

SUPERVISOR: DR OUMA M. O.

A RESEARCH PROJECT SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT FOR THE POST-GRADUATE DIPLOMA IN INTERNATIONAL STUDIES

NOVEMBER 2018

## **DECLARATION**

This research proposal is my original work and has not been presented for a degree in any other University.

Signed..... Date.....

## HUMPHREY KIMUTAI LANG'AT R47/8920/2017

This project has been submitted for examination with my approval as University Supervisor;

Signed..... Date.....

DR OUMA M. O.

LECTURER

INSTITUTE OF DIPLOMACY AND SECURITY STUDIES

# **DEDICATION**

To my wife and children

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I acknowledge with sincere gratitude the unequal contribution support and commitment of my supervisor in writing the proposal. Most of all I thank Almighty God for the health, amazing grace and strength, on the journey in completing research proposal development.

#### ABSTRACT

This study had the aim of making an assessment of the impact of civil-military cooperation on the conflict of Somalia 2012-2016. There were three specific objectives that guided the study and they included an attempt at identifying accrued achievements of the civil-military actors in conflict resolution in Somalia, to examine the role of the civil-military relations in Somalia and to assess the challenges faced by civil-military cooperation actors in Somalia. Two theories formed the foundation of this study; Huntington Civil-Military Relations Theory and Feaver's principal-agent model. The focus of the study was on reaching those respondents that have knowhow on civil-military cooperation especially on the Somalia conflict. The study focused on civil-military actors like the military, police, humanitarian workers and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs). Ex-post factor research design anchored the methodology of the study and the design was quite useful since the phenomenon of civil-military relations was to be reported and described as it has occurred in the field of conflicts and disasters like in Somalia. The target population comprised of the views of experts and stakeholders involved in fostering for peace in Somalia. These views were collected from journal and articles about Somalia. The study was a desktop review of journals and articles on civil-military cooperation in Somalia. The study concluded that the three null hypotheses were rejected. The focus of chapter two was basically on the aspect of civil-military cooperation and success involved in civil-military cooperation. The study established that the success of civil-military relations in Somalia is notable from growing tendencies of civilian and military actors who have complement the efforts of each other in the attempt at stabilizing the country. Chapter three highlighted the role of the civil-military arrangement of working together in Somalia. The role of actors such as the Government of Kenya and Ethiopia which have repeatedly sent military forces into Somalia to counter terrorist groups was established. Additionally, the study captured the role of the United Nations Security Council, the African Union, and the Intergovernmental Authority for Development (IGAD) and East Africa Community attempts at scaling down the threat of Al-Shabaab and support to the Somalia government. Chapter four attempted to establish the challenges faced by civil-military actors in Somalia. The null hypothesis was that there are no significant challenges faced by civil-military cooperation actors in Somalia. The findings of the study were the civilian groups as well as the military forces from various countries have often faced the risks posed by Al-shabaab terror group which has threatened the achievement of the set objectives by these entities. The study recommends that the success of civil-military actors in conflict resolution in Somalia should be scaled up to fully coordinate and utilize the capability of the actors currently in place. The study recommended that civil-military relations in Somalia are very essential for the overall political resolution in Somalia. The study recommended that efforts should be undertaken by the various actors in the Somalia conflict to overcome the challenges facing civil-military actors.

DECLARATION	II
DEDICATION	III
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	IV
ABSTRACT	V
TABLE OF CONTENTS	VI
ABBREVIATIONS	IX
CHAPTER ONE	1
INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background to the Study	1
1.3 Statement of the Research Problem	5
1.4 Research Questions	6
1.5 Objectives of the Research	7
1.6 Specific Objectives	7
1.7 Literature Review	7
1.7.1 Constitution of healthy civil-military cooperation	7
1.7.2 Success of the civil-military actors in conflict resolution in Somalia	8
1.7.3 Role of the civil-military relations for the overall political resolution	12
1.8 Challenges Faced by Civil-Military Actors	13
1.9 Gaps in the Literature Reviews	15
1.10 Justification of the Study	15
1.11 Hypotheses of the Study	15
1.12 Assumptions of the Study	16

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.13 Scope and Limitations of the Study	16
1.14 Theoretical Framework	16
1.14.1 Huntington Civil-Military Relations Theory	16
1.14.2 Feaver's Principal-Agent Theory	20
1.15 Research Methodology	22
1.16 Research design	22
1.17 Population	23
1.18 Data Collection Instrument	23
1.19 Data analysis and processing	24
CHAPTER TWO	25
SUCCESS OF CIVIL-MILITARY COOPERATION	25
2.1 Introduction	25
2.2 The Concept of Civil-Military Cooperation	25
2.3 Defining the Civil Military Actors	28
2.4 Interaction Involving Civilian and Military Actors	32
2.5 Success of Civil-Military Actors in Conflict Resolution	36
2.6 Chapter Summary	38
CHAPTER THREE	40
ROLE OF THE CIVIL-MILITARY RELATIONS IN SOMALIA	40
3.1 Introduction	40
3.2 Civil-Military Cooperation in Somalia	43
3.2.1 International NGOs and Aid Agencies	44
3.2.2 Role of IGAD in Somalia	45

3.3 Chapter Summary	7
CHAPTER FOUR	8
CHALLENGES FACED BY CIVIL-MILITARY COOPERATION ACTORS	8
4.1 Introduction	8
4.1.1 Global Terrorism and Emerging Challenges	8
4.1.2 Conflict between the Military and Civil Government	0
4.1.3 Militarization and Politicization of Civil-military Relations	2
4.1.4 Concept of Counter-Insurgency Strategies	4
4.1.5 Relationship between Military and Humanitarian Community	6
4.2 Chapter Summary	9
CHAPTER FIVE	0
SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	0
5.1 Introduction	0
5.2 Summary	0
5.3 Conclusions	1
5.4 Recommendations	3
5.5 Area for Further Research	4
REFERENCES	5

# ABBREVIATIONS

AMISON- African Union Military Observer Mission in Somalia

**CIMIC**- Civil Military Cooperation

**CMC**- Civil Military Cooperation

**IDPs**- Internally Displaced Persons

**NATO-** North Atlantic Treaty Organization

NGO- Non Governmental Organization

**UN-** United Nations

#### **CHAPTER ONE**

#### INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY

#### 1.1 Introduction

The Somalia conflict a derivative of a failed internal systems of governance has mutated in scope and influence to a regional and global concern drawing to itself international players and diverse reaction from the very players seeking to mitigate its unwarranted impact. The research intends to delve into the impact of civil-military cooperation on the conflict of somalia within the period 2012-2016.

#### **1.2 Background to the Study**

The working together of the military and civilian organization stem from the fact that each of these institutions harbour unique capability that can complement the efforts of the other. This cooperation aims at harnessing the unique capabilities of each of the institution for the sake of furthering the good of the society. From the beginning, the objective of the working party involving the military and civilian organizations is to promote human security and enhance the capacity of the population in conflict areas to meet their basic needs. Traditionally, the concept of civil-military relationship was ideal seen as involving the military in the field of conflict where they complemented the incapacities and ineffectiveness of civilian organizations. However, due to the complexities of the current global conflicts and the emergence of terrorism, civil military has taken the dimension of complementation of the civilian and military institutions to pacify conflicts.<sup>1</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Khalid, Z. (2015). The Importance of Healthy Civil-Military Relations for Effective National Security. Pakistan Insider, pg. 1-2

A society's civil-military cooperation's constitute a complex system of factors. Five key variables are central to how the system functions: the priorities of the civilian government, the civilian trust of the military, the military trust of the civilians, the external institutions that define their mutual interaction, and the actual skills of the military and civilian elites.<sup>2</sup> These variables are mutually related and thus constitute a system. The purpose of the system is to maximize the legitimacy and effectiveness of the state. However, its ability to achieve these goals depends both on the civil-military system per se and on a plethora of exogenous factors that determine the health and strength of the system: the general legitimacy of the government, state, and constitution; the civilian strategic culture; the values defining military culture; administrative reforms; popular militarism; the skills and personalities of individual leaders; the general level of threat; and the character of the conflicts in which the state engages. The choice of policy should be tailored to the state of the fundamentals of the elite civil-military system.<sup>3</sup>

For a long time, Somalia has been a country totally engulfed in war and has been categorically classified as a failed state. However, through the intervention of the African Union (AU) as well as the European Union (EU) that led to the formation and deployment of African Union Mission in Somalia (AMISOM) troops in the country, it is currently in a state of repair. Somalia has even found itself with a new constitution, new state of sovereignty as well as a resemblance of statehood amid cases of intentional secession and insecurity mostly perpetrated by the terror group Al-shabaab. Political polarization as well as clan-rivarly and regionalism are some of the other issues that are emerging that threaten the attempt at

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Ahmad, J.K., Devarajan, S., Khemani, S., and Shah, S., (2005). Decentralization and Service Delivery. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper No. 3603.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Segui, N.R. (2013). PSC Rétrospective. Appraising the role of the AU in Somalia", Issue No. 42 ISS Peace and Security Council report No.8.

creating a sense of nationhood in Somalia. Through the new constitution, the country is making amend at restoration of peace and security that has for a long time threatened the stability of the country.<sup>4</sup>

For a lengthy period of time, one of the potent challenges that have been in the line of focus for the efforts of international players in the attempt to stabilization of Somalia has been the issue of humanitarian aid. This issue had undermined any attempt at building peace initiatives in the country or even undertaking counterterrorism efforts to root out terror groups and provide a chance to peace and stability. Any attempt by the international community at providing humanitarian assistance to mostly the civilian population mostly affected by the civil strife was usually violently opposed by terror groups like the Al-shabaab. Indeed, humanitarian aid was usually finding itself at the control of these groups who usually misused it or a means of seeking loyalty from the vulnerable population of Somalia. The humanitarian aid to Al-shabaab was the means of forcing allegiance and support from the suffering population of Somalia.<sup>5</sup>

As a means of ensuring that that the humanitarian aid disbursed to save the vulnerable population of Somalia from suffering did not end in the hands and control of Al-shabaab, the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) established the Civil Military Cooperation (CIMIC). CIMIC was also established a responsible organization of ensuring accountability in the large quantities of relief assistance sent to Somalia. It was ideal an approach that brought together the cooperation of the military and civilian cooperation as a way of ensuring

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Garrett, M. (2013). Somalia: Gaining Momentum in a War-Torn State. *Journal of Global Development and Peace*, 1 (2), 2-3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Hagmann, Tobias and Chinwe Ifeijka Speranza, (2010). New Avenues for Pastoral Development in sub-Saharan Africa, *European Journal of Development Research*, 2 (2), 593-604

good will and integrity in the management of the humanitarian aid sent to Somalia.<sup>6</sup> Through CIMIC, a number of players were brought on board as an attempt to integrate the efforts of stabilization of Somalia. They included the United Nations, Somalia Interim Government, and Non-Governmental Organizations operating in Somalia and other private entities with interest in the country.

Through CIMIC a number of interventions intended to pacify the state of security and semblance of peace were initiated. They ranged from at arrangement of security for convoys of humanitarian aid travelling for supply purposes in the mostly vulnerable sectors of Somalia. Other included provision of security in various refugee camps set allover Somalia. There was also mapping of famine zones for easier logistics in supply of relief aids which was also combined with guidelines of ideal methodologies of navigating through the various disaster zones in Somalia. Another integral process of the CIMIC activities was peace keeping operations with the sole purpose of ensuring peace and security in the country.<sup>7</sup>

Through CIMIC, which is usually land based, efforts have been programmed and executed with the aim of undertaking maritime security operations with the aim of eradicating piracy as well as ensuring emergency responses are provided whenever disaster occurs in Somalia. Through CIMIC, these operations have been fruitful in ensuring that relief assistance that has targeted population usually arrive to such people without fail and without of interference of third-parties like the terror group Al-shabaab. CIMIC has also starved the diversionally tactics that resulted in relief assistance diverted from target population leading to the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Ayuba, C. (2014). Civil-Military Relations in Peace building: Boko-Haram in Perspective.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Ayuba, C. (2014). Civil-Military Relations in Peace building: Boko-Haram in Perspective.

phenomenon of occurrences of artificial droughts and famines that led to wanton suffering of innocent populations.<sup>8</sup>

The effort of CIMIC has witnessed a situation whereby more and more international aid groups are willing to come in and create an enabling atmosphere of relief assistance to the vulnerable population in Somalia. By the end of 2013, there were approximately twenty five humanitarian aid groups located and operating in Somalia. These actors has pledged and practically donated relief aid approximated at over five hundred and twenty three American dollars mostly to refugee camps and IDP camps. The aid provided included clean water for home consumption, medical treatment as well as vaccines to combat the various diseases in refugee and IDP camps. The medicines mostly include those for fighting communicable diseases as an effort to restore the physical health of the affected civilian population in Somalia. The players also organized on creation of learning and such education facilities for the children and youths as mostly a campaign to eradicate suffering of the people as well as provision of security for the victims of human trafficking in the camps.<sup>9</sup>

#### **1.3** Statement of the Research Problem

There is a new trend of multinational military forces being given humanitarian roles and mandates. The military forces are promptly acting in the face of a humanitarian crisis. Humanitarian agencies are also interposed with the military forces in the delivery of food to refugees in warring nations like in Albania, Kosovo and Somalia.<sup>10</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Ayuba, C. (2014). Civil-Military Relations in peace building: Boko-Haram in Perspective.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Segui, N.R. (2013). PSC Rétrospective. Appraising the role of the AU in Somalia", Issue No. 42 ISS Peace and Security Council report No.8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Uniting Our Strengths for Peace, (2015). Politics, Partnership, and People, *Report of the High-Level Independent Panel on UN Peace Operations*.

Despite the presence of humanitarian agencies in Somalia, an acute humanitarian situation continues to persist and it is feared that the return of Somalis from neighbouring countries would exacerbate the crisis. At least 4.7 million people (40% of the population) need support, especially the 1.1 million internally displaced persons (IDPs).<sup>11</sup> Additionally, 950,000 people are suffering from food insecurity with another tens of thousands forcefully evicted from their homes. Due to the loss of power and territory by Al-shabaab in Somalia, the organization has metamorphosed to the use of urban guerilla tactics targeting civilians and infrastructures in neighbouring countries like Kenya and Uganda which have troops in Somalia.<sup>12</sup>

Although studies have been conducted on the conflict situation in Somalia (Heiberg,; Onditi & Okoth;<sup>13</sup> Segui<sup>14</sup> few have analyzed on the impact of civil-military cooperation as a source of the mitigation to the crises. This study aims at filling this gap by assessing the impact of the existing cooperation between the various civil authority actors and the military authorities in Somalia.

#### **1.4 Research Questions**

- 1. What is the success of the civil-military actors in conflict resolution in Somalia?
- 2. What is the role of the civil-military relations in Somalia?
- 3. Which are the challenges faced by civil-military cooperation actors in Somalia?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Segui, N.R. (2013). PSC Rétrospective. Appraising the role of the AU in Somalia", Issue No. 42 ISS Peace and Security Council report No.8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Uniting Our Strengths for Peace, (2015). Politics, Partnership, and People, *Report of the High-Level Independent Panel on UN Peace Operations*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Segui, N.R. (2013). PSC Rétrospective. Appraising the role of the AU in Somalia", Issue No. 42 ISS Peace and Security Council report No.8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Onditi, F. & Okoth, P. G. (2016). Civil-Military Relations and the African Standby Forces' Multidimensionism, *Journal of African Conflicts and Peace Studies*: Vol. 3: Iss. 1.

#### **1.5** Objectives of the Research

The purpose of this study is to assess the impact of civil-military cooperation on the conflict of Somalia 2012-2016.

#### **1.6** Specific Objectives

- 1. To identify the success of the civil-military actors in conflict resolution in Somalia.
- 2. To examine the role of the civil-military relations in Somalia.
- 3. To assess the challenges faced by civil-military cooperation actors in Somalia.

#### **1.7** Literature Review

#### **1.7.1** Constitution of healthy civil-military cooperation

Civil-military relations may be stated as the arrangement by civilian institutions as well as the military ones to work together during conflicts.<sup>15</sup> In this arrangement, there is deliberate and mutual respect on the capacity of each party to complement the working together. For example, in Pakistan, civil-military cooperation is usually visible where the political organizations constituted of the prime minister and other civilian institutions have the arrangement of ensuring the national goals are met with the assistance of the military as comprised of the army, navy and air force.<sup>16</sup>

When referring to healthy civil-military relations, the emphasis is on creating stability and development of a country with the balanced involvement of both the military and civilian institutions. It is balanced in the sense that the well-being of the population is taken care of such that only the good of the two institutions is shared with the people. Even as the two

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Khalid, Z. (2015). The Importance of Healthy Civil-Military Relations for Effective National Security. Pakistan Insider, pg. 1-2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Khalid, Z. (2015). The Importance of Healthy Civil-Military Relations for Effective National Security. Pakistan Insider, pg. 1-2

institutions complement the effort of each other in national development, it should never be lost that they are distinct entities with diverse cultures and their actions should only be government by the constitutional requirements of the country.<sup>17</sup>

It is the duty and responsibility of the national police force to provide internal protection to the lives and general welfare of the population in any country. On the other hand, the military has the responsibility of ensuring there is total protection of the state in totality. Sometimes during state of wars, the military is accorded the extra mandate of performing the police duties. In this state of arrangement, a lot of care must be taken since this kind of scenario is a recipe for chaos and disorder in a democratic society.<sup>18</sup>

#### **1.7.2** Success of the civil-military actors in conflict resolution in Somalia

There are a number of military and civil humanitarian actors who usually participate in efforts aimed at creating stabilization is disaster prone areas like the one found in Somalia. These military and civilian players may be members of international groups and especially the United Nations agencies, regional groups like the African Union, East African Community of European Union or even locally based NGOs. In instances where there exists necessity for peace operations and specifically disaster-related assistance, both the international, regional and locally based players combine their efforts with government based organs and may also link with the locally based population in an attempt to forge peace and security.<sup>19</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Uniting Our Strengths for Peace, (2015). Politics, Partnership, and People, *Report of the High-Level Independent Panel on UN Peace Operations*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Khalid, Z. (2015). The Importance of Healthy Civil-Military Relations for Effective National Security. Pakistan Insider, pg. 1-2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Khalid, Z. (2015). The Importance of Healthy Civil-Military Relations for Effective National Security. Pakistan Insider, pg. 1-2

Sometimes, in an effort to streamline the process of disbursing humanitarian assistance, internationally based organizations may integrate their efforts with both the regional and locally based players in order to create a better impact on their efforts. This way, their efforts are more effective and have a greater and dependable impact on the targeted population in terms of the assistance provided.<sup>20</sup> It is a well-known fact that the NGO usually have widespread effect and impact on their efforts at provision of relief aid to the vulnerable and affected population and especially so in creation of tangible mechanisms at resolution of various disputes. NGOs usually are able to bring together rival and warring groups in peaceful resolution of disputes more than other groups.<sup>21</sup>

Since NGOs have a better understanding of the situation on the ground, there representatives have a better linkage of the membership of the various warring groups and are able to forge ties and links that assist in dispute resolution. The membership of NGOs usually have an understanding of the origin and proliferation of conflicts which enable them to come up with ideal infrastructures for creating and sustaining peace initiative involving various combatants. They also have the resources for ameliorating the disputes that usually feed the proliferation of conflicts and disputes.<sup>22</sup> In their field of operation, NGO have moved beyond the traditionally accepted notions of solving disputes that involved the belief that provision of basic facilities like water, housing, emergency medical care, monitoring and evaluation of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Franke, (2006). The peace-building dilemma: civil-military cooperation in stability operations. *International Journal of Peace Studies*, 11 (2), 1-2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Fallows, R. (2009). Peace Operations. Negotiation Journal, 1 (1), 4-9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Rubinstein, R. (2008). Cross-Cultural Considerations in Complex Peace Operations. *Negotiation Journal, 19* (1), 29-49

adherence to human rights as well as creation, funding and empowerment of local civil society as the important efforts at fostering peace and security.<sup>23</sup>

Throughout the efforts by NGOs at enhancing amicable dispute resolutions, the success of this process usually is dependent on the skills possessed by the membership of the personnel involved in the process. These skills are usually founded on the experience of the involved parties at arbitrating disputes related to the one in context. The parties involved usually possess community centred approach that is useful in much tandem with the required need of the conflict at hand also applicable at the local level. Successful peace-building efforts by both the civilian and military actors involve the ability of establishing conducive and tangible relationship that involve understanding of the intricacies of the local culture that enable the peace builder to contact the warring parties. Lack of knowledge of the local culture of the warring parties may spell doom to the peacemaking efforts of the actors on the ground. For example, scholar attributes the failure and low-level success on the efforts of United States of America to stabilization of Iraq on lack of understanding of the local Arabic culture, Arabic speakers and interpreters by the American peace builders as well as non-understanding of local customs<sup>24</sup>

For successful resolution of existing disputes, it is crucial for the locally based NGOs as well as their supporters and financers to invest more in building the capacity of these NGOs. Specifically, improving of the operational capacity of the locally based NGOs will go a long way in polishing their capacity and level of success in peace building efforts. Local NGOs

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Rubinstein, R. (2008). Cross-Cultural Considerations in Complex Peace Operations. *Negotiation Journal*, 19 (1), 29-49

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Franke, (2006). The peace-building dilemma: civil-military cooperation in stability operations. *International Journal of Peace Studies*, 11 (2), 1-2

also require collaborating with other regional and international actors in enhancing their capacity to success in arbitrating conflicts. One of the players that locally based may forge links with is the military establishment. This is irrespective of the fact that the military establishment is increasingly becoming complex in terms of the activities that they are currently performing in the modern field of international, national and local conflicts. The current complex and emerging duties being undertaken by the military are continuously overlapping with those performed by civilian organizations hence the need for care in forging the linkage. A good case in point is the role of the military as players in peace negotiations that finally resulted in ceasefire and calming in hostilities in Angola, Mozambique and Bosnia-Herzegovina conflicts.<sup>25</sup>

The cooperation involving the military and the civilian entities has also witnessing the involvement of military actors in such efforts as provision of logistical support in issues related to monitoring of adherence of ceasefires and no-fly zones in areas such Northern Iraq and Libya. The military has equally been involved demobilization exercises involving warring parties in such countries as Namibia and Mozambique as well as establishment of refugee camps and Internally Displaced Persons camps in Kenya and Northern Uganda. The military has also supported the civilian humanitarian exercises like securing and supporting of relief aid convoys in Democratic Republic of Congo, Yemen and Iraq and other such wartorn countries. The military has also seen its services sought in disaster prone areas where it has participated in building bridges and constructing of camps for the affected population, for example in Indonesia and Guatemala.<sup>26</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Fallows, R. (2009). Peace Operations. Negotiation Journal, 1 (1), 4-9

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Rubinstein, R. (2008). Cross-Cultural Considerations in Complex Peace Operations. *Negotiation Journal*, 19 (1), 29-49

Through the effort of networking of the civilian institutions and the military, intervention bridges have been established involving the intervention force, relief organizations and civilian entities that have greatly impacted on the success rate of arbitration and resolution of conflicts in various parts of the world. Civil-military cooperation can effectively bridge the gap between the intervention force and the relief organizations and civil institutions, and can become an effective force multiplier. The complementing effect of the civil-military cooperation can best be illustrated in the Operation Endure Freedom in Afghanistan that had great success rate.<sup>27</sup>

#### **1.7.3** Role of the civil-military relations for the overall political resolution

According to the ideal of military professionalism, the military should have its own separate codex based on obedience to the civilian government who decides the role and mission assignment. The military should have a loyalty to the nation as a whole. Due to the colonial legacy in Africa of pitting ethnic groups against each other both within the army and between the army and certain ethnic groups and regions in the society at large, the military in many African countries is never achieved such a loyalty. A good number of the African armies are never able to form a separate collective identity strong enough to overcome the ethnic cleavages that it was originally created along.<sup>28</sup>

There is the inherent contradiction in the relationship between the civilian-military interests in democracies. On the one hand, a well-established democracy requires full civilian control and accountability over all areas of public interest, but on the other hand most countries deem it necessary to create and maintain military and security capabilities for their own protection

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Franke, (2006). The peace-building dilemma: civil-military cooperation in stability operations. *International Journal of Peace Studies*, 11 (2), 1-2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Heiberg, L. (2010). Civil-Military Relations in Uganda. Trykk: Reprosentralen, Universitetet i Oslo.

and as a measure of international leverage. The military is by its very nature a potential threat to democracy; it possesses a superior, highly effective organization, with arms at its disposal. The balance in the relationship between the military and the civilian democratic institutions is not often questioned in the minds of the ordinary citizen in peaceful and prosperous times, but it is very much a concern for those living under undemocratic regimes, or where the military have undue or excessive political and societal influence and in extreme cases cast their professionalism aside for personal profit.

A natural point of departure for the study of civil-military relations is to find out what characterizes good or healthy civil-military relations on the one hand, and poor or unhealthy ones on the other. Even when being sensitive to the fact that there are different values and ideas about how these relations should be in different an ideal definition is made Fitch who lists three essential characteristics of a democratic civil-military relation:<sup>29</sup> The first consideration is that the military must be politically subordinate to the democratic regime. This requirement goes directly to the core of the idea of democracy as a government of the people by the people. The government is an institution elected by the people, and it is therefore given the right to act on its behalf and promote the people's interests.

#### 1.8 Challenges Faced by Civil-Military Actors

Balance civil-military cooperation's involves the arrangements where the military institution complements the efforts of the civilian humanitarian organization with the aim of achieving common objectives of national development. This arrangement is sometimes faced with a number of challenges that curtail this ideal working relationship. The major challenge that confronts this working arrangement is the attainment of the proximate and genuine interface

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Fitch J. Samuel 1998. The Armed Forces and Democracy in Latin America. Johns Hopkins University Press

where the complementation of the two institutions is perceived to be optimal. The achievement of the ideal balance is usually the most important aspect of this mutual arrangement of working together.<sup>30</sup>

Ideally, a balanced working relationship involving the two organizations is created out of respect for oversight on the terms of the mutual cooperation. Both the military and the civilian institutions should be geared to mutually respect the terms of the oversight as presented in the agreements of working together. For the terms of the cooperation to be mutually respected, the arrangement should take heed on the importance of outlining issues to do with perception of internal and external threats to the agreement as well as the ideological and cultural diversity existing in the internal and external mechanisms of the institutions.<sup>31</sup>

It is also noteworthy to take into consideration the experience of the military and civilian institutions gained from the plethora of global conflicts from where their participation has occurred. It is notable that militaries have taken part in humanitarian activities all over the world especially so in the post-Cold War era. This should be perfectly acknowledged especially as a parameter of honing out agreements of the two institutions. Though it is understood that the military usually brings a lot of capabilities and experience in zones of conflicts and disaster affected areas, there need to be great care where participating in arrangements involving the working together of the military and civilian organizations.<sup>32</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup>Janjua, (2010). Civil-Military Relations: The Impact of Internal and External Factors in Shaping the Balance of Civil and Military Power. *NDU Journal*, *1* (1), 26-27

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Janjua, (2010). Civil-Military Relations: The Impact of Internal and External Factors in Shaping the Balance of Civil and Military Power. *NDU Journal*, 1 (1), 26-27

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Brooks, J. (2015). Challenges of Civil-Military Engagement in Humanitarian Action: An Overview. *International Peacekeeping*, 18 (4), 234-235.

#### **1.9 Gaps in the Literature Reviews**

The available literature review does not address the role of regional bodies, extend of collaboration in the conflict management in Somalia with the international bodies and non-state actors. The dynamics of post-cold war error on the civil military cooperation are not captured adequately. An analysis of the impact of civil-military cooperation as a tool for mitigation of conflict is another gap.

#### **1.10** Justification of the Study

This study will be significant for the governments in Eastern Africa with interest on the Somalia conflict on the need to embrace civil-military cooperation in the endevour to promote permanent peace in the country. The study will be significant to the Non-government Organizations involved in humanitarian activities in Somalia since it will highlight the necessity of civil-military cooperation as a mechanism of dissolving the conflict in the country. Future scholars and academic community will use this study as a stepping stone for further studies. The scholars will use this study as a reference and a basis for discussions on the civil-military cooperation oriented studies.

#### 1.11 Hypotheses of the Study

Ho1: There is no significant success of civil-military actors in conflict resolution in Somalia.

 $H_{02}$ : There is no significant role of the civil-military relations for the overall political resolution in Somalia.

H<sub>03</sub>: There are no significant challenges faced by civil-military cooperation actors in Somalia.

#### **1.12** Assumptions of the Study

The study assumes that there exist a relationship between civil-military cooperation and conflict resolution in Somalia. The study will also assume that the respondents will freely and honestly cooperate in provision of information that the study will seek.

#### **1.13** Scope and Limitations of the Study

The focus of the study will be on reaching those respondents that have knowhow on civilmilitary cooperation especially on the Somalia conflict. The study will focus on civil-military actors like the military, police, humanitarian workers and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs). The study will focus on the 2012-2016 periods.

#### **1.14 Theoretical Framework**

Two theories will lay the foundation of this study; and Huntington Civil-Military Relations Theory and Feaver's principal-agent model. These theories are illustrated in this section.

#### **1.14.1 Huntington Civil-Military Relations Theory**

The proponent of civil-military relations theory was Samuel Huntington in 1977. The theory is well recognizable in the publication entitled *Soldier and the State* which makes an attempt of relating the inter-mix in the working of the military and the civilian entities.<sup>33</sup> The theory as stated by Samuel Huntington postulates that there should be an overall control of the military by the civilian power. He further states that in an ideal situation the military should be under the total control of a civilian authority. This control of the military by the civilian authority is focused from two dimensions by Huntington.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Tuininga, R.A. (2013). The emerging pattern of civil-Military Relations in Islamist states. A Master of Arts in Security Studies Thesis of University of California, Berkeley.

First, the civilian authority should be in a subjective control of the military through total maximization its overall power of control. The ability to achieve total control of the military should be through the use of special arrangement involving the respective institutions. It may also be done through decrees proclaimed by the constitution of the state or may arise as a result of existence of conflicts between the various classes in the respective society.<sup>34</sup>

Huntington further argues that throughout the history of the civil-military relations, the military institution has found itself under the control of the civilian powers. However, though this control has been the case as stated, Huntington does not highly regard it's significant, strength and long-term sustainability. Huntington further argues that the notion of the civilian control over the military establishment that is often used by individuals with vested interest of dominating the other group with the sole purpose of intimidation and oppression. It is further a means of suppression and domination that characterize one civilian group over another group that poses as a rival in power plays.<sup>35</sup>

In reality, Huntington belief that the idea that is forwarded by the concept of objective control of the military involves attempts at inculcating the mind set of professionalism in the military establishment. It is also the deliberate professionalization of the military establishment by ensuring that it is apolitical in terms of eliminating any tendencies by the military to get entangled in local and domestic politics. Through this format, the military establishment that is professional and under the control of civilian leadership ensures that it has the guidance and will-power of protecting and securing the legitimate authority that is entitled over the control and governance of the nation. However, in its attempt and will-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Tuininga, R.A. (2013). The emerging pattern of civil-Military Relations in Islamist states. A Master of Arts in Security Studies Thesis of University of California, Berkeley.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Ahmad, J.K., Devarajan, S., Khemani, S., and Shah, S., (2005). Decentralization and Service Delivery. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper No. 3603.

power to secure the legitimate authority, the military always remain as a neutral player in the political contests in the state.<sup>36</sup>

Under the theory of civil-military relationship, Huntington has further build on the concept of subjective-objective network of power plays by the state and the military. He has done this through addition of two other dimensions of the civil-military power interplay. The first interplay involves the political power held by the military. This refers to the legal authority held by the military and which accord it some influence in the state affairs. Huntington argues that the political power of the military does not necessarily point to the fact that it uses this power to undermine or intrude into other systems of power. It also does not mean that the military may have the tendency of misusing this power to pressures other institutions for influence within the state affairs. The true reference is that the military has significant influence within the state establishment even without immersing itself in internal politics of the state.<sup>37</sup>

The second dimension of civil-military dimension according to Huntington involves the scrutiny of the power and values that are in possession of the dominant party in the state. Is is a reference to the dominating ideology that the domineering power beliefs in.<sup>38</sup> this ideology may have two references; it may be supportive of the military establishment or it may be opposing the military dominance in the affairs of the society. This scenario of either supporting or opposing the military dominance in the society informs Huntington theory and has been heavily assisted in defining the civil-military cooperation in the current world. This

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Kohn, Richard H. (2009). Tarnished Brass: Is the U.S. Military Profession in Decline? World Affairs.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Ahmad, J.K., Devarajan, S., Khemani, S., and Shah, S., (2005). Decentralization and Service Delivery. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper No. 3603.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Ahmad, J.K., Devarajan, S., Khemani, S., and Shah, S., (2005). Decentralization and Service Delivery. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper No. 3603.

has seen the presence of retired military personnel involved in running organizations under civilian authorities and even has been documented by various scholars in the field of civil-military cooperation globally.<sup>39</sup>

Despite the efforts made by Huntington in his endevour at advancing the theory of civilmilitary relations, a number of weaknesses have been noted in his approach. Abrahamsson noted that the linkage between Huntington analysis of the historical interconnect between civilian and military establishment is not informative of modern realities.<sup>40</sup> On the other hand, Thomas Bruneau noted that Huntington theory of civil-military relations has many weaknesses that it cannot stand the reference of empirically anchoring the concepts it purports to study. Bruneau additionally states that Huntington theory has not been able to categorically highlight the distinction between what he call as professionalism in the military establishment and the concept of civilian control over the military and he only make reference to just a few analogies to highlight this relationship.<sup>41</sup>

Throughout his criticism, Bruneau establishes that to concretely rely on Huntington theories and frameworks of civil-military relations, scholars are made to redefine some of the terminologies applied in his theory in order to clearly articulate their ideas. This theory is applicable in this study since it is critical in establishing and highlights the interaction between the civilian organizations like humanitarian aids groups and NGOs in Somalia and the manner they interact with the military and police forces in conflict resolution in this country. The interplay between civilian organizations operating in Somalia and the various

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Tuininga, R.A. (2013). The emerging pattern of civil-Military Relations in Islamist states. A Master of Arts in Security Studies Thesis of University of California, Berkeley.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Ahmad, J.K., Devarajan, S., Khemani, S., and Shah, S., (2005). Decentralization and Service Delivery. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper No. 3603.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Tuininga, R.A. (2013). The emerging pattern of civil-Military Relations in Islamist states. A Master of Arts in Security Studies Thesis of University of California, Berkeley.

military players led by forces like AMISOM as well as the Kenyan, Ethiopian and US force operating in this country further highlights the application of this theory.

#### 1.14.2 Feaver's Principal-Agent Theory

The proponent of Principal-Agent theory was Peter Feaver in 1978. Feaver came up with this theory as a response to the failure of Huntington Civil-military relations theory whose ideas had failed in predicating the outcomes of the Cold war. This theory according to Feaver offered the best approach at providing an evaluation on the weaknesses of Huntington theory. Fever's theory has borrowed heavily from the principals of microeconomic theory and specifically on the approach of using principals and agents as a referral point for evaluating outcomes of a given phenomenon<sup>42</sup>

The theory proposes that it is the onus of the civilian principal in this set up to create a military agent who in turn provides the requisite security for the state establishment. However, the civilian principal must continuously ensure that the military agent is loyal in the process provision of security as per the mandate of the civilian principal. This means that the necessary civilian oversight over the military must at all times be adhered to. This is due to the fact, if not well taken care of, the principal agent relationship have the tendency of being abused.<sup>43</sup>

The only advantage that civilian institution has over the military ones is that they have several layers of oversight mechanisms that gives credence and lowers the chances of the military agent from not abiding by its responsibility of providing the requisite and specified

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Tuininga, R.A. (2013). The emerging pattern of civil-Military Relations in Islamist states. A Master of Arts in Security Studies Thesis of University of California, Berkeley.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Tuininga, R.A. (2013). The emerging pattern of civil-Military Relations in Islamist states. A Master of Arts in Security Studies Thesis of University of California, Berkeley.

security arrangements.<sup>44</sup> Several advantages are noticeable from the perspective of Feaver's Principal-Agent theory when compared to Huntington's theory. The first advantage is that this theory makes recognition of the existing power derived from the formal and informal control mechanisms from the civilian entities of state over the military institution. As seen with Huntington's theory, the common belief was that there can never be subjective control of the military institution since it has inherent weaknesses and it is only suitable for controlling weak and unprofessional military institutions.

However, Feaver argues that subjective control of the civilian organizations over the military is relevant even with the modern military institutions that have high commitment to adhering to the oversight by democratic institutions controlled by the civilian authorities. Feaver further argues that the idea of professionalism in the military institution as stipulated by Huntington is based on the balancing act involving the agreement of both the civilian and military leadership.<sup>45</sup> Moreover, according to Huntington, the state of non-partisan that the military normally observes when it comes to the politics of a state is usually a phenomenon derived from the internal domains and beliefs of the military institution.

However, Feaver beliefs that the non-partisan aspect of the military on the political affairs stem from the fact that the military respects the politics of a state and understands and acknowledge the various advantages of playing neutral to the political inclinations of a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Msila, V., & Setlhako, A. (2013). Evaluation of Programs: Reading Carol H. Weiss. University of South Africa, College of Education, Department of Education Leadership and Management. Pretoria, South Africa: Horizon Research Publishing.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Msila, V., & Setlhako, A. (2013). Evaluation of Programs: Reading Carol H. Weiss. University of South Africa, College of Education, Department of Education Leadership and Management. Pretoria, South Africa: Horizon Research Publishing.

state.<sup>46</sup> Feaver's theory gives credence to the fact that civil-military relations is an approach that creates impetus on the achievements of set objectives by both the civilian and military institutions in creating stability in conflict zones in the world.<sup>47</sup>

In the context of the Somalia conflict and based on Feavers' theory the major principals include countries like Kenya, Ethiopia, Uganda and Burundi that have stakes in the achievement of peace in the country. Others include the United Nations, European Union and the African Union. The various humanitarian aid organizations are also principals in the Somalia conflict. The AMISOM troops stationed in the Somalia as well as the Somalia State Army forms the agents who are on the ground to fulfill the will of the agents of stabilization of the country. This theory is relevant in this study since it clearly creates the foundation for the interplay involving civilian institutions and the military actors in the resolution of the conflict in Somalia. It highlights the nature of the interaction existing among the various civilian actors and the military forces in Somalia.

#### 1.15 Research Methodology

#### 1.16 Research design

This study employed an ex-post facto research design. Cohen, Manion, & Morison<sup>48</sup> define ex-post facto as that research in which the independent variable or variables have already occurred and in which the researcher starts with the observation of a dependent variable. The researcher then studies the independent variable or variables in retrospect for their possible

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Msila, V., & Setlhako, A. (2013). Evaluation of Programs: Reading Carol H. Weiss. University of South Africa, College of Education, Department of Education Leadership and Management. Pretoria, South Africa: Horizon Research Publishing.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Msila, V., & Setlhako, A. (2013). Evaluation of Programs: Reading Carol H. Weiss. University of South Africa, College of Education, Department of Education Leadership and Management. Pretoria, South Africa: Horizon Research Publishing.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morison, K. (2008). *Research Methods in Education*. London: Routledge Falmer.

relationship to, and effects on, the dependent variable or variables.<sup>49</sup> This study considered the civil-military cooperation as the independent variables. The civil-military cooperation was then considered to have influence on the dependent variable, conflict in Somalia. From the forgoing, ex-post facto research was therefore suitable for this study because the civil-military cooperation has already been undertaken to mitigate on the conflict in Somalia.

#### **1.17** Population

A population refers to an entire group of persons, events or elements of interest that a researcher wishes to investigate, have at least one thing in common and make inferences based on sample statistics.<sup>50</sup> It is the larger group from which the sample is taken.<sup>51</sup> The study population comprised of the experts and stakeholders involved in fostering for peace in Somalia. Target population comprises of the total number of subjects of interest to the researcher.<sup>52</sup> For this study, the target population comprised of the views of experts and stakeholders involved in fostering for peace in Somalia. These views were collected from journal and articles about Somalia.

#### **1.18 Data Collection Instrument**

This study used desktop review of journals and articles on civil-military cooperation in Somalia as the main tool for collecting the data. These views were from authentic views of scholars and experts on Somalia.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morison, K. (2008). *Research Methods in Education*. London: Routledge Falmer.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Cooper, D. R. & Schindler P.S. (2011). *Marketing Research*. New York: McGraw –Hill.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Bogdan, R. C., & Biklen, S. K. (2007). *Qualitative research for education: An introduction to theories and methods (5th Ed.).* Boston: Pearson Education.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Bogdan, R. C., & Biklen, S. K. (2007). *Qualitative research for education: An introduction to theories and methods (5th Ed.).* Boston: Pearson Education.

# 1.19 Data analysis and processing

Data analysis involves reducing accumulated data to a manageable size, developing summaries, looking for patterns and applying statistical techniques. Data preparation includes editing, coding, and data entry and is activity that ensures the accuracy of the data and their conversion from raw form to reduced and classified form that are more appropriate for analysis. Quantitative data was generated. Quantitative data was analyzed using descriptive statistics including correlation analysis.

#### **CHAPTER TWO**

#### SUCCESS OF CIVIL-MILITARY COOPERATION

#### 2.1 Introduction

The chapter makes an attempt at highlighting the role played by the existing civil-military relations in Somalia as an approach and pacifying the conflict. This is done through discussing the concept of civil-military cooperation in Somalia and its success in stabilization of the conflict.

#### 2.2 The Concept of Civil-Military Cooperation

Civil-military cooperation is a concept that relate to the process of creating a linkage involving the traditional military way of life into a unified mode of capabilities that aim at play a significant role in alleviating the human wants.<sup>53</sup> It is the process that involves creation of rapport involving the civil and military entities with the chief aim of sharing the ultimate purpose in alleviating challenges that afflict human beings. It may also be looked as the deliberate actions by both the civilian and military institutions with the sole purpose of creating and enhancing the capacity of the civilian population at solving their basic necessities.<sup>54</sup>

The aim of civil-military cooperation is pacifying the various conflicts affecting the way of life of people by stabilization them through peaceful resolutions in attempt to create a sense of normalcy. Before the modern era of civil-military relationship, troops in the field of conflict acted as the solution to the vacuum left during conflicts and they used their military

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Joachim, J. and A. Schneiker (2012). 'New Humanitarians? Frame Appropriation through Private Military and Security Companies', *Journal of International Studies*, 40(2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Bellamy, A., Paul, W., & Stuart, G. (2014). Understanding *Peacekeeping*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.

capability to solve the conflict militarily.<sup>55</sup> Due to the nature of modern conflicts, various actors have seen the sense of incorporating the working relationship between the civil and military arms as a means of navigating through the modern and complex theatre of conflicts. They are doing this by coming up with their own doctrines of creating a definition of the nature and state of civil-military cooperation.<sup>56</sup>

For example, in July 2003, the membership of North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) established its own doctrine related to civil-military cooperation. This doctrine attempted to define the concept of civil-military cooperation as a basis of creating an agreement of coordination, cooperation and support of the missions involving the commanders of NATO forces and the various civilian organizations involved in the conflict zones. It also incorporated the cooperation, coordination and support of national and local population as well as other players like non-governmental organizations and other civilian entities in operation to pacify the conflict.<sup>57</sup>

In the modern sense of civil-military cooperation, the focus of the actors is based entirely on three core functions: inculcating a sense of cooperation between the military and existing civilian organizations operating in the conflict zone; assisting the civilian population engulfed by the conflict and supporting the stabilization force mandated with the duty of enforcing peaceful resolution of the conflict.<sup>58</sup> A good example, during the Bosnia and Herzegovina conflict, the military actors created a working rapport with the civilian actors in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Bellamy, A., Paul, W., & Stuart, G. (2014). Understanding *Peacekeeping*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> NATO, (2014.). 'NATO Civil-Military Co-Operation (Cimic) Doctrine Allied Joint Publication 9', http://www.nato.int/ims/docu/AJP-9.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> NATO, (2014.). 'NATO Civil–Military Co-Operation (Cimic) Doctrine Allied Joint Publication 9', http://www.nato.int/ims/docu/AJP-9.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> NATO, (2014.). 'NATO Civil–Military Co-Operation (Cimic) Doctrine Allied Joint Publication 9', http://www.nato.int/ims/docu/AJP-9.pdf.

coordinating the transportation of essential goods like electrical transformers and turbines through the contested territories with the aim of installing emergency power for the civilians caught in the conflict.

Through the civil-military cooperation, some duties that the military actors may consider as civilian in nature are expanded by the working together of the two parties. Through civil-military relations, various activities are undertaken that cut through the military forces, the civilian organizations as well as the general population involved in the conflict area. Though there is a sense of overlapping of the civil-military activities on the ground, there is usually a defined doctrinal separation of the activities undertaken by each of the party.<sup>59</sup>

Through civil-military cooperation, a roadmap is usually provided of the guidelines on the nature of the interaction involving the civilian and military actors. It also defines the nature of the interaction involving the military and the various humanitarian organizations including the civilian organizations, local population, international humanitarian groups as well as the non-governmental organizations among many others. This relationship is well defined for there to be successful achievements of the various objectives of the humanitarian missions. For NATO, a clear demarcation of the interaction during civil-military cooperation has the primary aim of enhancing coordination, cooperation among the actors and in the process reducing the tendencies of duplication and overlap during the process of meeting the various humanitarian needs in the theatre of conflict. The streamlined cooperation enhances

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Joachim, J. and A. Schneiker (2012). 'New Humanitarians? Frame Appropriation through Private Military and Security Companies', *Journal of International Studies*, 40(2).

efficiency and effectiveness in meeting the goals of the actors in provision of humanitarian assistance to the affected population.<sup>60</sup>

#### **2.3 Defining the Civil Military Actors**

The purpose of the cooperation involving the civilian and military actors has the sole purpose of ensuring that there is unconditional resolution of the various problems afflicting the human population caught up in the field of conflict. Solving the humanitarian need of the civilian population amicably is the single important mandate of the civil-military cooperation.<sup>61</sup> In this context, the civilian and human players involved in this interaction have membership either from international organizations, United Nation agencies as well as from the international, regional and local NGOs.<sup>62</sup>

From the military players in civil-military cooperation, there is usually the acknowledgement of the fact that the civilian organizations in the theatre of the conflict encompass a variety of actors each with distinct role in the cooperation. From the perspective of NATO, there exist three categories of civilian organizations. These are international organizations, non-governmental organizations as well as the international and national donor agencies. From this categorization, the membership of international organizations includes the various agencies of the United Nations as well as the civilian actors form the European Union.<sup>63</sup>

In addition, the composition of the non-governmental organizations comprise of such groups that are non-profit and without any political affiliation with other players in the conflict.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> NATO, (2014.) 'NATO Civil-Military Co-Operation (Cimic) Doctrine Allied Joint Publication 9', http://www.nato.int/ims/docu/AJP-9.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> NATO, (2014.). 'NATO Civil-Military Co-Operation (Cimic) Doctrine Allied Joint Publication 9', http://www.nato.int/ims/docu/AJP-9.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Joachim, J. and A. Schneiker (2012) 'New Humanitarians? Frame Appropriation through Private Military and Security Companies', *Journal of International Studies*, 40(2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Fallows, R. (2009). Peace Operations. *Negotiation Journal*, 1 (1), 4-9.

They comprise of groups that are independently funded with membership from both the international and local affiliated groups.<sup>64</sup> The membership varies from the Red Cross, Red Crescent and related groupings. In the course of disaster and peace relief operations, international organizations have close interaction with both the official institutions of the government of the ay as well as the local population involved in the disaster or conflict. For the purposes of effective collection and dissemination of crucial information related to the conflict or disaster, the international organization usually have close-knitted working ties with individual from the local community or those from the locally based non-governmental organizations.<sup>65</sup>

The close-knitted working relationship enables the international organizations to have immeasurable success in the provision of humanitarian assistance to the affected population due to the fact that they enjoy local contact with the aid recipients. Local non-governmental organizations have the advantage of mutual confidence from the local population and even the belligerents in the conflict since they have first-hand knowledge of the conflict or disaster at hand. Since the membership of the local non-governmental organizations have first-hand information of the conflict, they enable the international organizations partnering with them to create a successful web of distribution of essential resources with greater success and are thus able to achieve their intended objective in a faster way. This way they are able to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup>Civil-Military Cooperation in... (PDF Download Available). Available from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/242666658\_CivilMilitary\_Cooperation\_in\_Multinational\_and\_Interag ency\_Operations [accessed May 16 2018].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Fallows, R. (2009). Peace Operations. *Negotiation Journal, 1* (1), 4-9.

creatively facilitate the resolution of the dispute or disaster at hand with wider degree of success<sup>66</sup>

Currently, most of the international organizations, non-governmental organizations as well as other related civilian actors have moved their relief efforts from the traditional methodologies of provision of basic necessities such as water, emergency health related activities and foodstuffs to new fronts of monitoring violation of human rights to other higher scale activities. Through continuously forging ties among the membership of the feuding parties, these civilian organizations are successful in encouraging, creation and reconstruction of successful civil society players who continues with the process of monitoring the peace resolutions agreed upon.<sup>67</sup>

From the point of view of the international organizations as well as the existing nongovernmental organizations in the conflict, the success of peace building among the belligerents rests on the ability to harness the skills obtained from the experience acquired through continuous engagement in peace resolutions with the membership of the communities under the conflict. This approach which has the tell-tale signs of communitycentred strategy has the potential of successfully assessment of the needs of the community and the feuding groups which essential make use of requisite skills that commensurate with the requirements of such communities in the peace building process.<sup>68</sup>

For the sake of ensuring success in the peace building process, creating of rapport with the local population is the ideal starting point as well as having some requisite knowledge of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Rana, R. & F. Reber (2007). Civil-Mil Relations: A Discussion Paper for NGO Seminar on Civil-Mil Relations, 3– 4 December, http://www.ngovoice.org.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Rana, R. & F. Reber (2007). Civil-Mil Relations: A Discussion Paper for NGO Seminar on Civil-Mil Relations, 3– 4 December, http://www.ngovoice.org.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Bellamy, A., Paul, W., & Stuart, G. (2014). Understanding *Peacekeeping*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.

existing cultural beliefs and practices of the people. For example, from the perspective of scholars on the Iraq conflict, the myriad of problems that the American forces endured in their effort at stabilization of the conflict were mostly as a result of lack of requisite knowledge of the local culture. This was compounded by scarcity of Arab speakers and interpreters to assist the American forces to acclimatize with the conflict as well as the local custom of the people of Iraq.<sup>69</sup> This therefore call for the need for the military actors, international organizations and local non-governmental organization to strive to understand the culture and customs of the local populations for them to overcome the various challenges that may create bottle necks in the endevour for effective peace building process.<sup>70</sup>

For successful achievement of peace and security in conflict zones, the military is an effective and dependable partner. However, due to the complexities of the modern global conflict as characterized by emergency of global terrorism, the functions of the military are increasingly overlapping with those of the civilian organizations. Instance where the military has been involved in peace negotiations have been documented indicating the extent of the overlap of functions with civilian players. Examples are there of such negotiations in Mozambique, Angola and Bosnia-Herzegovina conflicts.<sup>71</sup>

The military overlap with civilian actors in the theatre of conflict is also seen where the military has been called in enforcement of ceasefires as well as securing the transportation of relied aid for civilian actors for the affected populations. The military has been called upon in building of camps for internally displaced persons and other refugees in Mali and Darfur. This therefore portrays the fact that the civil-military interaction can act as an effective

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Fallows, R. (2009). Peace Operations. *Negotiation Journal*, 1 (1), 4-9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Rana, R. & F. Reber (2007). Civil-Mil Relations: A Discussion Paper for NGO Seminar on Civil-Mil Relations, 3–4 December, http://www.ngovoice.org.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Bellamy, A., Paul, W., & Stuart, G. (2014). Understanding Peacekeeping. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.

parameter of bridging the gap and creating a network of success for both the civilian and military actors in the field of global conflicts.<sup>72</sup>

### 2.4 Interaction Involving Civilian and Military Actors

New relationship involving civilian actors and the military players have been forged and cemented in the post-cold war period of global conflicts. This era has witnessed some of the gruesome, complex and complicated atrocities practiced in the field of global conflicts. The theatre of modern conflict has been characterized by genocides like the one in Rwanda, Darfur, Democratic Republic of Congo, Kosovo, Syria and Bosnia among many others. It has also witnessed ethnic cleansing like those in Sri Lanka, Colombia, India and Pakistan among many others. Large scale displacement of societies has also been witnessed in Somalia, Kenya and Uganda.<sup>73</sup>

This mix of atrocities calls for new approaches by both the civil and military players to reconcile the belligerents in these conflicts. This has witnessed the emergence of a growing number of international and local organizations, which are well funded and with specialized skills of confronting and resolving the modern conflicts as well as extending their skills to resolving the post conflict reconstruction activities necessary for overcoming such conflicts.<sup>74</sup>

Some of these groups of successful actors in the current global conflicts include entities under the auspices of the United Nations, international non-governmental organizations,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> NRC (2011) A Partnership at Risk? The UN–NGO Relationship in Light of UN Integration, NRC Discussion Paper, December.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Rana, R. & F. Reber (2007). Civ-Mil Relations: A Discussion Paper for NGO Seminar on Civ-Mil Relations, 3–4 December, http://www.ngovoice.org.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Haysom, S. & Jackson, A. (2013). 'You don't need to love us': Civil-Military Relations in Afghanistan, 2002–13. Stability: *International Journal of Security & Development*, 2(2),1-16.

civilian relief and development entities, for example the Canadian International Development Agency and the USAID. Although these organizations acknowledge the significance of the military establishment as an important actor in resolving the crises, they clear understand that it only has a short tem impact on the actual conflict. This is due to the fact that the military will immediately exit the scene of the conflict once the immediate conflict is diffused. But this does not necessarily signify the end of the conflict and the international and local civilian actor have to remain in the scene of the conflict into the future monitoring the situation through deliverance of the needed basic humanitarian assistance.<sup>75</sup>

Since most international civilian organizations have a sense of independence emanating from the fact that they are mostly self-funded, they therefore have little obligation of falling under the rules of the military commanders in the conflict zones. Local authorities in the zones of conflict may not feel very comfortable coming under the direct influence and control of the foreign military in the conflict. Sometimes, the military leadership has to confront the reality of having some civilian organizations that to some extent may be against the mission and doctrine of the military in the context of the conflict at hand. Therefore since the international and local civilian organizations may not be at ease of working under the military commands, it is therefore the onus of the military to devise ways of working and cooperating with them.<sup>76</sup>

The military may not be in a position to undertake the duty of providing basic necessities like food and shelter for a lengthy period of time despite the fact that it has massive capabilities. It may not be in a position to undertake such civilian activities like seeking shelter and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> SCHR (Steering Committee on humanitarian Response ), (2010). Position Paper on Humanitarian–Military Relations, http://reliefweb.int.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> SCHR (Steering Committee on humanitarian Response) (2010) Position Paper on Humanitarian–Military Relations, http://reliefweb.int.

employment for the refugees or according protection to individuals or even the government for a long duration of time. However, both international and local civilian organizations have the requisite capacity and capabilities to undertake most of these activities with ease. They have the necessary skills and experience of constructively engaging in such activities leading at the end of the day at realization of the set objectives by the military. The military requires the assistance of civilian humanitarian actors to achieve the intended success in their missions. However, mostly military leadership is reluctant to engage with and work closely with international civilian organizations and non-government organizations due to inherent mistrust, doctrines of operations and differing institutional cultures.<sup>77</sup>

Unlike the military that is hierarchical in structure, civilian humanitarian organizations have flat structures with decision making mostly based on committee set ups. They also tend to mostly take directions from within their own systems. Sometimes, conflicts arises where some civilian humanitarian organizations are reluctant to offer direct cooperation to the military due to the perception of loss of impartiality or conflict of interest due to the cultural differences involving these organizations.<sup>78</sup>

There is also the handicap of lack of requisite skills on the side of both the military and the civilian organizations not understanding the capacity of each. They also fail to acknowledge the fact that there is little knowledge on the actual areas of cooperation given the differences in the culture of the two institutions that pose a challenge in their working together in global conflict areas. The challenge of biases and beliefs founded on flimsy understanding of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Rana, R. & F. Reber (2007). Civ-Mil Relations: A Discussion Paper for NGO Seminar on Civ-Mil Relations, 3–4 December, http://www.ngovoice.org.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Haysom, S. & Jackson, A. (2013). 'You don't need to love us': Civil-Military Relations in Afghanistan, 2002–13. Stability: *International Journal of Security & Development*, 2(2),1-16.

military and civilian institution on the preference of working with each usually create a barrier on the cooperation involving the two actors.<sup>79</sup>

To majority of the civilian humanitarian organizations, their supreme belief stems from the importance of remaining impartial in their engagement with other players and at the same time preserving their identities and independence since they are mostly self-funded. They therefore keep away from political interests compounding the conflicts at hand and may not be willing to play at the whims of the military institution. Civilian humanitarian organization usually belief that the military lack the necessary knowledge and capacity on the distribution of relief service and have priorities on fixing mandates of their mission as well as the political interests of their principals.<sup>80</sup>

The civilian humanitarian organizations also acknowledge the fact that the military is usually reluctant in sharing intelligence information since it has mistrust over the civilian entities. However, the military believes in getting intelligence information from civilian institutions at any time and at any place. The military on the other hand is never comfortable in working with civilian organizations since they are so many and usually have no identical philosophy and mandates. The civilian agencies are too fragmented and heterogeneous and may never have similarities in objectives of their missions.<sup>81</sup>

The issue of large numbers of civilian humanitarian organizations in each conflict is usually a point of concern to the military. For example there were over one hundred and nine

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> SCHR (Steering Committee on humanitarian Response) (2010) Position Paper on Humanitarian–Military Relations, http://reliefweb.int.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> NRC (2011) A Partnership at Risk? The UN–NGO Relationship in Light of UN Integration, NRC Discussion Paper, December.

NRC, (2011). A Partnership at Risk? The UN–NGO Relationship in Light of UN Integration, NRC Discussion Paper, December.

humanitarian entities operating in Rwanda during the genocide of 1994. In the Bosnia conflict, over one thousand seven hundred organizations were on the ground during the conflict. It is acknowledgeable that large numbers of the civilian organization may be beneficial during a conflict. However, creating a coordination and cooperation point of context may be a challenge to the diversity of the mandate of every organization. This usually creates a security concern that the military is not willing to get in.<sup>82</sup>

The sheer number of humanitarian organizations and the competences they put on the ground is another area of conflict with the military during conflicts. Though a number of civilian organizations are professionally experienced in their undertakings, others are simply clueless on the conflict at hand. Some of the small groupings of the civilian organizations may have knowledge of the conflict at hand but lack the capacity to offer any assistance. Others have no administrative capacity to perform the activities they purport to undertake. This therefore means that the perception formed by the military based on the capability of the small and incapacitated entities may inform the general perception of the military on every humanitarian organization in the field of conflict.<sup>83</sup>

#### 2.5 Success of Civil-Military Actors in Conflict Resolution

Civil-military cooperation involves the interface among the civilian, police, and military components of a peace operation with respect to political, security, humanitarian, developmental, and other dimensions of the operation. It describes the relationship between

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> SCHR (Steering Committee on humanitarian Response) (2010) Position Paper on Humanitarian–Military Relations, http://reliefweb.int.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Haysom, S. & Jackson, A. (2013). 'You don't need to love us': Civil-Military Relations in Afghanistan, 1– 13. Stability: *International Journal of Security & Development*, 2(2), 1-16.

the civil authority of a given society and its military authority.<sup>84</sup> Civil-military cooperation has arisen due to the trend of increased frequency and scale of natural disasters in many areas of the world. Protracted complex emergencies are eroding the coping mechanisms of millions of vulnerable civilians, coupled with new conflicts that have arisen in many parts of the world.

In such increasingly complex crises, a growing number of actors (e.g. military, police, private security, customs, etc) are gradually becoming involved and searching for synergies.<sup>85</sup> An ideal civil-military cooperation involves assigning the military missions that are directed externally and that are of a traditional war fighting or defending nature, is supposedly conducive towards building a stronger sense of military professionalism, as well as keeping the military from meddling in domestic politics. Britain has continuously maintained post-independence civil-military relationships with its former African colonies. For example, African soldiers have continued to train in British military institutions such as the Royal Military Academy Sandhurst (RMAS) and the Defence Academy of United Kingdom (UK). Similarly, Britain has continued to maintain military training bases in a number of African countries like Kenya.<sup>86</sup>

Moreover, under the Defence Diplomacy initiative, now referred to as security cooperation, the British government continues to promote conflict prevention and post-conflict recovery in transitional democracies, including its former African colonies, through a series of educational programmes for the civilian and military institutions. Britain has also deployed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Uniting Our Strengths for Peace, (2015). Politics, Partnership, and People, *Report of the High-Level Independent Panel on UN Peace Operations*.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> Jayasundara-Smits, Shyamika (2016). Time to Bite the Bullet: Fostering Civil-military Synergy in EU Crisis Management and Peacebuilding Operations (Unpublished) https://www.researchgate.net/publication/308163254
<sup>86</sup> Harper, M. (2012). *Getting Somalia Wrong*. International African Institute. The Royal African Society and Social Research Council, Cynthia Street. London.

defence attachés (DA), military and civilian defence advisors and the establishment of British military advisory and training teams (BMATT). These programmes are aimed at promoting good governance and the management of defence to ensure both national and global security.<sup>87</sup> For example, in Ghana, institutions such as the Ghana Armed Forces Command and Staff College and the Kofi Annan International Peacekeeping Training Centre (KAIPTC) are supported in the provision of different training and capacity-building courses for military personnel from Ghana and other African countries. These programmes have an overall impact on force structures, the evolution of doctrine, combat and staff training, and the conduct of operations.

### 2.6 Chapter Summary

This chapter has focused on the concept of civil-military cooperation and success involved in civil-military cooperation. It has commenced by defining the nature of the cooperation between the civilian and military elements. This has been through acknowledging the fact that civil-military encompasses activities undertaken to establish and maintain relations between military forces and civil authorities as well as the general population. Civil-military cooperation has arisen due to the trend of increased frequency and scale of natural disasters in many areas of the world. It has highlighted the fact that the success of civil-military is notable from growing complexity of operational requirements where states are increasingly recognizing and intensifying working relationship between military and civilian actors.

The actors involved in civil-military relations in Somalia have been grouped into military, police, private security, customs, international organizations and international, regional or local non-governmental organizations (NGOs). The chapter expresses another success

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Cleary, Laura (2011) op. cit

emanating from the fact that post-Cold War has ushered in a new relationship between the military and civilian organization actors due to complicated ethnic maelstrom characterized by mass murder, massive civil displacement based on mutual violence and revenge. Finally the challenges to do with civilian and military relationship in Somalia have been expressed ranging from lack of knowledge about one another's organizational identities, cultures, images, and fundamental goals that constitute and constrain their activities in multinational operations.

#### **CHAPTER THREE**

### **ROLE OF THE CIVIL-MILITARY RELATIONS IN SOMALIA**

#### 3.1 Introduction

Somalia has experienced one of the longest running and bloodiest conflicts on the African continent. Civil and military approaches have been attempted to salvage the humanitarian crisis in Somalia since 1991. Instability, weak governance and insecurity dominate the relationship between Somalia and its neighbours. The Government of Kenya and Ethiopia has repeatedly sent military forces into Somalia to counter administrations it considers to be hostile (Angstrom, 2013). Humanitarian and aid agencies have invested in relief supply and support to the affected population. Al-Shabaab's mishandling of the crisis in 2011 in Somalia led to erosion of public support and its withdrawal from the capital. This was later followed by expulsion of Al-Shabaab from most of southern Somalia by the African Union Military Observer Mission in Somalia (AMISOM) and Kenyan and Ethiopian forces.

International support for government security forces, allied militia and AMISOM has continued in Somalia. The military roles constitute a part of the society, and have its own special corporate interests, and there is no guarantee that these interests and goals will coincide with those of the rest of the society. The military can therefore never legitimately claim to represent the will of the people. The military can however have a limited influence in policy making and exercising based on their professional expertise, but the military cannot have the right to veto the government's proposals.<sup>88</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Fitch J. Samuel 1998. The Armed Forces and Democracy in Latin America. Johns Hopkins University Press

Secondly, the civilian government must have full control over policymaking and there cannot be a special area of security or national interests that are left exclusively in the hands of the military. Finally the military personnel must be subject to the same rule of law as the rest of the population. They have the same constitutional rights as non-military citizens, and cannot be granted special privileges. Desch states that although one can say that the relationship is good when the military stays strictly within its professional realm, and poor when the military strays outside that realms, in the case of coups for instance; he suggests that a better way is to analyze how civilian and military authorities handle policy differences, and that a healthy civil-military relationship exists where the civilian stands prevails over the military ones.<sup>89</sup>

Due to the potential danger the military establishment may pose both to the civilian leaders in government and the population at large, the military's capabilities and intentions must be placed under firm civilian control. In consolidated democracies this can basically be achieved through two mechanisms: objective civilian control, which is based on the professionalism of the military and subjective civilian control, which is based on politicizing the military. When it comes to the reality of many developing countries, it is necessary to also consider how neopatrimonial practices are used to ensure military loyalty to the civilian leaders.

Huntington is generally optimistic about the success of reforming civil-military relations in the third wave of democratization around the world. He states that with only a few exceptions, these countries have fared much better in subordinating the military to civilian authority and control than they have in establishing and consolidating other aspects of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Desch, M. C. (2009). *Civilian Control of the Military. The changing security environment.* Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press

Desch, M. C. (2009). *Civilian Control of the Military. The changing security environment.* Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press

democracy or further economic development. He also assess that the civil-military relations have improved greatly in comparison to the situation before the transition towards democracy. He attributes these successes to several factors, including a spread and acceptance of the idea that the military needs to be a professional, apolitical institution subordinated to civilian control. These are norms that are spread by the interaction of military elites and cooperation between the nations.<sup>90</sup>

There has also been a growing understanding that establishing objective control is in the best interest of both civilian and military leaders. Military regimes around the world have learned the hard way that solving a countries socioeconomic problems is not an easy task, and they are therefore more willing to stick to their own areas of professional expertise and leave the politicks to the politicians. There has also been a move towards realizing that employing military forces to gain advantages in the political game is a potentially dangerous enterprise on the behalf of the civilian leaders competing for power, and that their interest are really best served by keeping the military a professional, neutral force.<sup>91</sup>

Desch further states the most important factors in poor, undeveloped countries; civil-military reform that entails reduction of military spending, improvement in the respect of human rights, and transfer of military run business to civilian or state hands, are measures that are relatively easy to implement and which enjoys great legitimacy in both the eyes of the public and the international community. To be able to successfully carry out such reforms, the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> Huntington, S. P. (2010). Reforming Civil-Military Relations. Journal of Democracy. 6.4 pp 9-17

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Huntington, S. P. (2010). Reforming Civil-Military Relations. Journal of Democracy. 6.4 pp 9-17

civilian government must of course already have a certain degree of leverage towards the military, and the first two points must already be in place.<sup>92</sup>

In USA, the military has the leverage to manipulate the national security decision-making through several measures. These include a delicate balancing act while presenting the policy options to the executive and the Congress. The division of powers for military control between the President and the Congress as per the US constitution gives adequate space to the military to try and influence the defense policy in its favour. According to Clotfelter, "the Congress has the constitutional power to control defense policy but it acquiesces to the military as the leading Congressmen want to tread the path set out for them by the military." The military's predominant role in influencing political decision-making has been evidenced by military's aggressive advocacy of air and ground campaign despite McNamara's urging for restraint.<sup>93</sup>

## 3.2 Civil-Military Cooperation in Somalia

Civil-military cooperation has been witnessed in Somalia where the International Community has made efforts to promote peace and stability back to Somalia in different approaches. For example, the United Nations Security Council (UNSC) approved a unilateral UN military intervention to Somalia in 1992.<sup>94</sup> Similarly, the African Union (AU) has, with help of international community, made fifteen peace initiatives to create a functioning government in Somalia. Moreover, the Intergovernmental Authority for Development (IGAD) along with

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Desch, M. C. (2009). *Civilian Control of the Military. The changing security environment*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Janjua, (2010). Civil-Military Relations: The Impact of Internal and External Factors in Shaping the Balance of Civil and Military Power. *NDU Journal*, 1 (1), 26-27

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Hammond, L. & Lindley, A. (2014). *Histories and contemporary challenges of Somalia crisis and mobility*. Abingdon: Routledge.

the AU made efforts to bring the Somali conflict to an end through peaceful process. Somalia's neighbour's states have also made individual efforts to end Somalia's conflict.<sup>95</sup>

After the threat to Ethiopia and Kenya national security and stability as well as destabilization of the economy by waves of terror attacks which targeted some important sources in the country by Al-shabaab, the two countries have committed their troops to pacify Somalia. Kenya decided to immerse in Somalia's conflict militarily, in order to protect its national security. The KDF entered Somalia in 2011 in and fought with Al-Shabaab, capturing many territories inside Somalia from the group. The Kenyan troops have initially entered Somalia without the consent of Somalia's government, but were later on contributed to the AMISOM peace keeping mission under the mandate of AU and UNC. Ethiopia and Kenya with the assistant of other actors under AMISOM have managed to scale down the threat of Al-Shabaab and supported the Somalia government that is currently active in the capital Mogadishu.

### **3.2.1 International NGOs and Aid Agencies**

Western International NGOs have been active civilian actors in the Somalia peace process. Due to deteriorating security situations in central and south of Somalia, a number of civilian humanitarian organizations were forced to retreat from this region. This witnessed scaling down of these organizations from a high of over forty of them in 1995 to below fifteen in 2010. Most of these organizations relocated to other neighbouring countries like in Nairobi

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> McEvoy, C. (2013). *Shifting priorities: Kenya's changing approach to peace building and peacemaking*. Oslo: Norwegian Peacebuilding Resource Centre.

Kenya and only a few left the essential local staff in Somalia. Their focus was now on equipping the locally based civilian groups to continue with relief distribution.<sup>96</sup>

Having withdrawn their presence and services in Somalia had immediate devastating effect to the general population of this country. This was particularly so with the withdrawal of World Food Programme at the midst of a terrible famine in Somalia in 2011which left the population with a lot of suffering. Insecurity from the Al-shabaab terror group was the main reason that most of the civilian humanitarian organizations withdrew from Somalia. Al-shabaab viewed most of the humanitarian organizations as agents of the Western countries whom they viewed as their tormentors hence the open hostility towards them.<sup>97</sup>

To salvage the situation of the suffering of the innocent populations after the withdrawal, a number of non-governmental organizations devised contacts and agreements with Al-shabbab to continue distribution of humanitarian assistance to the local population. However, the United States put into effect restrictions on movement of supplies through the areas that they perceived as controlled by terror organization and in the process making it difficult for distribution of resources. This is the one single reason that led to the total withdrawal of civilian humanitarian organizations like World Food Programme.<sup>98</sup>

### 3.2.2 Role of IGAD in Somalia

IGAD was created with the chief purpose of dealing with issues related to drought and development. Today the organization can also be considered as a civil-military actor. IGAD

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Hammond, (2013). Somalia rising: things are starting to change for the world's longest failed state. *Journal of Eastern African Studies*, 7(1), 183-193.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> McEvoy, C. (2013). *Shifting priorities: Kenya's changing approach to peace building and peacemaking*. Oslo: Norwegian Peace building Resource Centre.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> Hammond, L. (2013). Somalia rising: things are starting to change for the world's longest failed state. *Journal of Eastern African Studies*, 7(1), 183-193.

played an important role in the Eldoret-Mbagathi Peace Process which started in October 2002.<sup>99</sup> The most important outcome of this process was the development and adoption of the Federal Charter which led to the formation of the Transitional Federal Government. Since 2002 IGAD had maintained a strong focus on Somalia, especially through the IGAD Office of the Facilitator for Somalia Peace and National Reconciliation. The main task of this political office had been to follow up the implementation of the Eldoret-Mbagathi Process. The office had dedicated itself to mobilize resources for the Transitional Federal Government and had sought to play a coordinating role.<sup>100</sup>

In 2012 IGAD developed a Grand Stabilization Plan for south-central Somalia. One of the central tasks of the plan was the establishment of local administration in Somalia (IGAD 2013). Kenya and Ethiopia were the dominating actors within IGAD in Somalia with the potential of driving IGAD initiatives in the directions of their own benefits. Kenya and Ethiopia entered Somalia with military forces. They needed an umbrella under which they could operate. They therefore adopted the IGAD Stabilization Plan, and developed a Jubba land initiative under it.<sup>101</sup>

The Jubbaland initiative was technically led by IGAD, but practically led by Kenya and Ethiopia. Kenya and Ethiopia also took central positions in the forming of the Joint Committee which would drive the IGAD Stabilization Plan. Informant D mentioned several problems in this process. First, the committee was chaired by Kenyans and Ethiopians and not by Somalis; second there were no other IGAD countries present; third the committee was

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Sabala, K. (2011). *Regional and extra-regional inputs in promoting security in Somalia*. Pretoria: Institute for Security Studies.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Hammond, L. and Lindley, A. (2014). *Histories and contemporary challenges of Somalia crisis and mobility*. Abingdon: Routledge.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Odowa, A. M. (2013). What can current leaders in Somalia learn from their past history. *The ITPCM International Commentary*, 9, (34), 19-23.

dominated by representatives of Somali origins – who could be suspected to have clan interests; and forth on the Kenyan side the work was led by people from security agencies.<sup>102</sup>

#### **3.3** Chapter Summary

This chapter has highlighted the role of the civil-military relations in Somalia. The chapter has started by highlighting the conflict situation in Somalia and the attempts by civil-military approaches to pacify and salvage the humanitarian crisis in the country. It has made reference to the efforts by the Government of Kenya and Ethiopia which have repeatedly sent military forces into Somalia to counter terrorist groups. It has illuminated the international support for Somalia government security forces led by allied militia and AMISOM that have continued to pacify the crises in Somalia. More importantly, the chapter has captured the role of the United Nations Security Council, the African Union, and the Intergovernmental Authority for Development (IGAD) and East Africa Community attempts at scaling down the threat of Al-Shabaab and support to the Somalia government. Finally, the chapter has given a detailed attempt by International NGOs and Aid Agencies and IGAD to mobilize support and resources for the Government of Somalia.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> Sabala, K. (2011). *Regional and extra-regional inputs in promoting security in Somalia*. Pretoria: Institute for Security Studies.

#### **CHAPTER FOUR**

# CHALLENGES FACED BY CIVIL-MILITARY COOPERATION ACTORS

### 4.1 Introduction

The expansion of military engagement in activities beyond their traditional combat mandates such as counter-insurgency, stabilization, or emergency relief operations, have often blurred the lines between military and humanitarian action. This is particularly common in recent counter-insurgency operations in Iraq, Afghanistan, and Pakistan, for example, where militaries have sought to use humanitarian assistance and aid provision to "win hearts and minds" among civilian populations. Another challenge derives from the use of military and civil defense assets (MCDA) for humanitarian operations in complex emergencies and natural disasters.<sup>103</sup>

Especially in acute emergencies, and in difficult to reach or insecure areas, militaries may have some operational advantages in terms of rapid mobilization, logistics, personnel, supply, access, or security to contribute to humanitarian response. While useful in disasters, however, humanitarian professionals have often maintained that the use of military assets in relief efforts, especially in in conflict, tends to increase risks to aid workers and the local population alike, and reduce the effective delivery of aid.<sup>104</sup>

### 4.1.1 Global Terrorism and Emerging Challenges

The responsibility of the military during the Cold War was simply defend their countries by establishing insurmountable defenses that would deter potential adherents from launching

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Lambert, A. (2011). From civil-military relations towards security sector government. *European Political Science*, *10* (2), 234-235

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Schmied, C. (2015). What are the challenges posed by civil-military cooperation and to what extent can they be overcome? *Small Arms and Insurgencies*, *24* (2), 234-235.

attacks on them. However, during the post-Cold War era, the phenomenon of global terrorism has emerged as the new threat to the security of the international community and has called for new approaches in dealing with and managing the realities involved.<sup>105</sup> The phenomenon of global terrorism has created new challenges to the military establishment that have made the significant of maintaining law and order more significant. This has also led to the emergence of national and international actors who are shaping the entire picture of the security situation both at the national and global spheres.<sup>106</sup> Some of the new players in the fight against global terrorism include state and non-state actors like NGOs, private military establishments as well as other related security firms.<sup>107</sup>

The military has been involved in various peacekeeping operations globally that have significant relations with the emergence of global terrorism. This therefore calls for the military to have possession of different set of capacities for adapting to the new duties of peacekeeping. For the military interventions in the emerging conflicts to bear significant results, and especially so with peacekeeping efforts, linkages involving the civilian and the military is required.<sup>108</sup> Since the threat posed by global security has both internal and external parameters, there is need for more enhanced linkages involving the security apparatus both within and outside the state and even involving local and foreign security machineries. The enhanced phenomenon of the new realities confronting the civil and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> Lambert, A. (2011). From civil-military relations towards security sector government. *European Political Science*, *10* (2), 234-235

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> Lambert, A. (2011). From civil-military relations towards security sector government. *European Political Science*, *10* (2), 234-235

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> Lambert, A. (2011). From civil-military relations towards security sector government. *European Political Science*, *10* (2), 234-235

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> Schmied, C. (2015). What are the challenges posed by civil-military cooperation and to what extent can they be overcome? *Small Arms and Insurgencies*, *24* (2), 234-235.

military actors creates a room for challenges involving issues like coordination, misunderstandings and tensions in the relationship amongst the actors.<sup>109</sup>

For the military and civilian to overcome the emerging challenges, they require a paradigm shift from the old way of confronting the emerging challenges and adopt new strategies that are in line and reality to the issues of today lifestyle.<sup>110</sup> This should be the starting point for both the civil actors and the military actors to take to overcome these realities. The civilian and military institutions should in reality understand that the issues of security in post-cold war have drastically from what there was before this period. The relationship involving the civilian and military players has also changed and it currently require proactive measure to cope with its speed of transformation.<sup>111</sup> As a matter of fact, the environment currently in existence has drastically changed the entire civil and military cooperation due to their complexes. The civil-military relations have also been greatly affected and have consequently led to more cases of confusion in the interactions.<sup>112</sup>

# 4.1.2 Conflict between the Military and Civil Government

The challenges confronting the military in the current global security arrangements emanates from the fact that though civilian authority in reality have the mandate of ensuring and practically securing the affairs of the state., they need a linkage with the military. In actualizing their sole mandate of decision making, the military need to recognize the cooperation and expert advice of the military. They also need to apply this role adequately

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Schmied, C. (2015). What are the challenges posed by civil-military cooperation and to what extent can they be overcome? *Small Arms and Insurgencies*, *24* (2), 234-235.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> Schmied, C. (2015). What are the challenges posed by civil-military cooperation and to what extent can they be overcome? *Small Arms and Insurgencies*, *24* (2), 234-235.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Lambert, A. (2011). From civil-military relations towards security sector government. *European Political Science*, 10 (2), 234-235

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Schmied, C. (2015). What are the challenges posed by civil-military cooperation and to what extent can they be overcome? *Small Arms and Insurgencies*, *24* (2), 234-235.

and in the process use their advice successfully. However, in reality this phenomenon is far much from the actual happenings.<sup>113</sup>

Presence of civilian leadership that fails to heed the warning of the military creates significant possibilities for confrontations with military and other security organs of the state. They also create a room for the military establish to be dissatisfied with the stubbornness of the civilian authorities. Finally, the strained relationship involving the two players may result into unpalatable consequences like coups fanned by the military. This disconnect on the other hand have significant effect on the degree of mutual cooperation involving the players and specifically so the political rulers.<sup>114</sup>

The challenges of the Iraq war that led to a number of controversies is a tell-tale sign that decision making was not properly executed as stated from the context of military experts in the field. There has been a variety of critical decision making that has involved various military personnel which expresses conflicting use of strategies. There has also been the revelation that civilian actors only give their decisions based on the objectives they want to personally gain from and not the reality of war. This finally results in dysfunctional civilian and military actors giving differing exerts opinions on the realities of the conflict leading to errors in decision making process.<sup>115</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> Schmied, C. (2015). What are the challenges posed by civil-military cooperation and to what extent can they be overcome? *Small Arms and Insurgencies*, *24* (2), 234-235.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Lambert, A. (2011). From civil-military relations towards security sector government. *European Political Science*, *10* (2), 234-235

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Schmied, C. (2015). What are the challenges posed by civil-military cooperation and to what extent can they be overcome? *Small Arms and Insurgencies*, *24* (2), 234-235.

# 4.1.3 Militarization and Politicization of Civil-military Relations

One of the biggest challenges to the process of on enhancing the relationship involving civil and military institutions emanates from the issue of widespread involvement in politics in an attempt to influence this relationship. Humanitarian assistance during periods of disasters has seen intercrop of politics as an avenue of influencing the entire scope of assistance to gain political mileage. Whereas the issue of humanitarian assistance should be purely so, the entry of politics create undue political angle that has no basis in the field of humanitarian aid.<sup>116</sup> Over and above the issue of politics, another chalice that often poisons the issue of civil-military cooperation is the challenge posed by attempts at pacifying warring groups through creation of stabilization pillars in the conflict as well as the counter-insurgency approaches employed to confront terrorism.

The issues related to the aspect of civil-military relations through application of counterinsurgency approaches have been in existence since the 1950s during the Korean and Vietnam wars. During these wars, the use of humanitarian assistance and such related basic services for humanity have been exploited to create political and sometimes military goals by the various actors involved in the conflicts. This has consequences on the entire directions of such conflicts.<sup>117</sup> The concerns of humanitarian actors regarding explicit linking of humanitarian action with political and/or military strategies relate primarily to complexities, and the implications these have for their own principles, strategies and operations.<sup>118</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Metcalfe, V., Haysom, S., & Gordon, S. (2012). Trends and challenges in humanitarian civil-military coordination: A review of the literature. *London: The Humanitarian Policy Group*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> Tuininga, R.A. (2013). The emerging pattern of civil-Military Relations in Islamist states. A Master of Arts in Security Studies Thesis of University of California, Berkeley.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Slim, H. (2011). NGO–Military Contact Group: Keynote Address, Conference on Civil–Military Relations in Natural Disasters: New Developments from the Field, 12 October.

Notwithstanding the comparative advantages the military may have in certain contexts and in relation to certain capabilities there remain serious concerns about the explicit linking of humanitarian and military or political objectives and the resulting expansion of the military into activities beyond their traditional mandates and areas of expertise. The discourse has focused mainly on conflicts, though the same principle applies in natural disasters. As Krahenbuhl asserts, in accordance with international humanitarian law the military have an obligation to undertake certain humanitarian activities, such as the evacuation of the wounded.<sup>119</sup>

However, concerns regarding the relations arise when humanitarian assistance becomes part of the military strategy. The second concern many humanitarians have is fear that their engagement with the military will mean that they are complicit in inappropriate or ineffective assistance that does not meet the needs of affected populations or fails to adhere to the principle of 'do no harm'. Humanitarians organizations also fear that coordinating with the military will be used to bring humanitarian action under military control.<sup>120</sup>

The experiences of the various conflicts zones have given prominent credence to such concerns of civil-military relations. The experience from such fields of war like Somalia, Afghanistan, Colombia, Iraq, Syria and such areas of conflict illuminates this aspect clearly. This is so especially with various United Nations missions deployed in these conflict zones as well as the involvement of numerous humanitarian organizations providing relief to the affected and suffering civilian population. However, the context of the conflict in the provision of relief by the military is not backed by factual data in the analysis of these

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Krahenbuhl, P. (2011). The Militarization of Aid and Its Perils, ICRC Resource Center Online, http://www.icrc.org.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> SCHR (Steering Committee on humanitarian Response), (2010). Position Paper on Humanitarian–Military Relations, http://reliefweb.int.

conflicts. The issue of how the military has risked the lives of the civilian and personnel from humanitarian aid bodies has not been well clarified. The issue of how the diversion of the military from its core business of provision of security to aid givers and how this has compromised the efficiency of the military has also not been fully clarified.<sup>121</sup>

### 4.1.4 Concept of Counter-Insurgency Strategies

Ideally, the various counter-insurgency approaches employed by the military in the 1950s, 1960s and 1970s, are the one that gave rise to the application and use of the military in provision of tactical advantages and strategic elevation to the various actors in these conflicts. Specifically, the earliest application of the concept of humanitarian assistance was in the 1950s during the experience by Britain in its campaigns in Aden, Oman and Malaya.<sup>122</sup> During the Vietnam War, the United States of America copied the counter-insurgency techniques employed earlier on by Britain in its counter-insurgency approaches. Especially so was the application of such approaches like Civil Operations and Revolutionary Development Support Programme (CORDS) in Vietnam by USA.

Nowadays, the various counter-insurgency offensives have the sole objective of continuous separation and protection of civilian population from the actual insurgencies in an attempt to curtail loss of life and injuries to the innocent. It also aims at establishing various reconstruction programmes aimed at winning and separating the civilian population from the insurgents in order to weaken the enemy and entirely defeat them.<sup>123</sup> This approach arise from the fact that contemporary counter-insurgency approaches understand the importance of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> Slim, H. (2011). NGO–Military Contact Group: Keynote Address, Conference on Civil–Military Relations in Natural Disasters: New Developments from the Field, 12 October.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> Barakat, S., S. Deely, S. &Zyck, A. (2010). A Tradition of Forgetting: Stabilization and Humanitarian Action in Historical Perspective', Disasters, 34(S3).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Tuininga, R.A. (2013). The emerging pattern of civil-Military Relations in Islamist states. A Master of Arts in Security Studies Thesis of University of California, Berkeley.

exploiting the sympathy of the civilian population through provision of reconstruction programmes with the sole purpose of eliminating the factors that feed and lead to the growth of the insurgency.<sup>124</sup>

Such factors include poverty, illiteracy and unfulfilled promises from mostly the civilian authorities that continuously perpetrate the insurgent cause. Provision of humanitarian assistance to such a population is a remedy to counter those factors that the insurgents employ to continuously get new recruits and thus sustain the insurgency. Sustained provision of humanitarian assistance is thus assumed as a sure bet in defeating insurgency. This therefore provides an insight in the civil-military relations in the field of counter-insurgency operations.<sup>125</sup>

The basic assumption behind the employment of this approach is that assistance to the civilian population caught at the middle of an insurgent in terms of establishment of small-scale projects leads to stabilization of the conflict. The use of such small-based assistance programmes have a high probability of enhancing the political as well as military objectives based on the conflict at hand. Reconstruction and rehabilitation programmes at the community level are ubiquitous for the provision of military gains in a conflict especially why counter-insurgency activities are concerned.<sup>126</sup>

The entire counter-insurgency approach is totally different from the basic parameters used by the humanitarian organization of provision of basic needs to groups of civilians in need of the assistance and specifically prioritizing on those in dire need of the aid. This approach makes

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> Wilder, A. (2009). Losing Hearts and Minds in Afghanistan', Viewpoints Special Edition, Afghanistan, 1979-2009: In the Grip of Conflict', Middle East Institute, Washington DC.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> Collinson, S. & Elhawary, S. (2012). Humanitarian Space: A Review of Trends and Issues, HPG Report 32. London: ODI.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> Fishtein, P. (2010). Winning Hearts and Minds? Examining the Relationship between Aid and Security in Afghanistan's Balkh Province. Medford, MA: Feinstein International Center, Tufts University.

it conditional for the provision of humanitarian assistance like in the case in Somalia and Afghanistan where military as well as political cooperation on the side of the civilian population is a perquisite to receiving the required assistance. The military has often used humanitarian aid as recourse for getting and gathering intelligence on the insurgents from the civilian population who in return receive aid.

The military therefore uses the issue of humanitarian aid to gain advantage of the insurgents through the intelligence gathered from the population in return for assistance.<sup>127</sup> Arguments have been made that through counter-insurgency activities, the military has the tendency of removing the humanitarian actors and even humanitarian assistance from the needy population that requires them. In the process, counter-insurgency operations are viewed as a danger to the civilian population and they even put their lives in danger of the insurgents. Those populations that accept and get assistance from the military may be viewed as a accomplishes to the military and may be targeted by the insurgents in retaliatory attacks.<sup>128</sup>

### 4.1.5 Relationship between Military and Humanitarian Community

There exists a contradiction, diversity and even inconsistency in the paradigm of the civilmilitary relations as expounded by proponents and scholars of this concept.<sup>129</sup> This state of confusion emanates from a number of diverse issues that informs the understanding of this relationship. For one, there is a critical lack of understanding as well as awareness on the legal context of the relationship between the military and the civilian institutions. This is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> Oxfam (2011) 'Whose Aid Is It Anyway? Politicizing Aid in Conflicts and Crises', Oxfam International.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Metcalfe, V., Giffen, A. & Elhawary, S. (2011.) UN Integration and Humanitarian Space: An Independent Study Commissioned by the UN Integration Steering Group, HPG and Stimson Center.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> Tuininga, R.A. (2013). The emerging pattern of civil-Military Relations in Islamist states. A Master of Arts in Security Studies Thesis of University of California, Berkeley.

usually witnessed in the context of the responsibilities that militaries from a foreign country is ought to bear in the context of involvement in a given conflict.<sup>130</sup>

There also exists the difficult of defining and adapting the mandate of the foreign military especially in the edicts of a third patty country. Deployment of foreign militaries faces the challenge of adaptation to the will-power of another country in terms of the scope and extent of its operations and relations with humanitarian organizations present in that country and conflict. A case in point is in Afghanistan where the aggressiveness of some humanitarian players with the military actors involved in that conflict has surmounted to widespread complications in the civil-military relationship, interactions as well as the coping strategies.<sup>131</sup>

This category of complications may be interpreted as the failure of the humanitarian players to critically assimilate and understand the basic importance of foreign military forces in pacification and stabilization of modern day global conflicts due to the nature of their complexities. It is also due to the lack of awareness and understanding of the legal instruments governing the use of foreign militaries in pacification of global conflicts. It may also be interpreted as a failure of humanitarian organization in understanding the nature of the conflicts as well as the ultimate duty of the UN Security Council in enforcing the resettlement of such conflicts with the use of foreign militaries.<sup>132</sup> Finally, it may also be seen as a failure of the concerned humanitarian organizations in clearly understanding their

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> Oxfam (2011) 'Whose Aid Is It Anyway? Politicizing Aid in Conflicts and Crises', Oxfam International.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> OCHA, (2011). Report of the Annual Meeting of the Consultative Group on the Use of Military and Civil Defense Assets (MCDA), Geneva, 21–22 November.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> Oxfam (2011) 'Whose Aid Is It Anyway? Politicizing Aid in Conflicts and Crises', Oxfam International.

role in such conflicts which is usually provision of necessary assistance to affected population as well as protecting the international law that govern their activities.<sup>133</sup>

Creating a level-ground for appropriate interaction for both the foreign militaries and the humanitarian organizations operating within such areas is usually difficult due to the legal status and the operating nature under which these forces are deployed. This confusion normally arises when the foreign force deployed in such a conflict actively engages in the intricacies of the conflict and is thus party to the conflict. The matter is more complicated whenever the deployed foreign force is operating outside the auspices of the United Nations mandate. For example, in the case of the Syria, Kosovo and Iraq conflicts, the United States have at times operated outside the United Nations and in the process complicating the situation in terms of the relationship with the humanitarian agencies.<sup>134</sup>

In the Kosovo conflict for example, the humanitarian agencies had a difficult task of coming up with a resolution of the best level of interaction with NATO forces operating from that country. This is due to the fact that the air campaign in Kosovo was operated by NATO forces outside the auspices of the United Nations and which initially was seen as illegally conducted by some civilian actors in Europe.<sup>135</sup> Sometimes, and within the peacekeeping operations by the United Nations, the Security Council's mandated operations may be conflicting with humanitarian actors active in a given conflict where the level of neutrality of the various players in not properly perceived and construed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> Macdermott, J. & Hanssen, M. (2010.) *Protection of Civilians: Delivering on the Mandate through Civil–Military Coordination*, Swedish Defence Research Agency.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> Brooks, J. (2015). Challenges of Civil-Military Engagement in Humanitarian Action: An Overview. *International Peacekeeping*, 18 (4), 234-235

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> Macdermott, J. & Hanssen, M. (2010.) *Protection of Civilians: Delivering on the Mandate through Civil–Military Coordination*, Swedish Defence Research Agency.

Tensions and misunderstandings may arise in such situations especially where the military may be viewed as duplicating the duties and responsibilities of the civilian and other humanitarian actors in the conflict. They will further lead to straining of the relationship between the civilian and military actors. The strained relationship may ultimately curtail the objectives of the military and humanitarian organizations and in the process affecting the entire conflict<sup>136</sup>

### 4.2 Chapter Summary

The chapter has highlighted on the challenges faced by civil-military actors in Somalia. The chapter has acknowledged the fact that post-cold war emergence of global terrorism has complicated the phenomenon of civil-military cooperation in Somalia as compared to the Cold War era. Again, the use of humanitarian assistance for political or military gain is entirely contrary to the concept of humanitarian action, which should be exclusively humanitarian and impartial in nature. Misunderstanding involving the military and humanitarian actor may be heightened by the mandate provide by such players like the United Nations to the foreign forces in a conflict. This may in the long run create complexities in the level of interaction among the various players involved in the conflict.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> Metcalfe, V., Giffen, Aa., & Elhawary, s. (2011). *UN Integration and Humanitarian Space:* An Independent Study Commissioned by the UN Integration Steering Group, HPG and Stimson Center.

#### **CHAPTER FIVE**

#### SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

#### 5.1 Introduction

This chapter illuminates the summary of the study as well as conclusions and recommendations based on the research objectives of the study.

# 5.2 Summary

The purpose of this study was to assess the impact of civil-military cooperation on the conflict of Somalia 2012-2016. Three specific objectives informed this study; to identify the success of the civil-military actors in conflict resolution in Somalia, to examine the role of the civil-military relations in Somalia and to assess the challenges faced by civil-military cooperation actors in Somalia. This study was significant since few empirical studies have analyzed the impact of civil-military cooperation as a source of the mitigation to the crises in Somalia. This study was also significant to the governments in Eastern Africa with interest on the Somalia conflict on the need to embrace civil-military cooperation in the endevour to promote permanent peace in the country.

Two theories formed the foundation of this study; Huntington Civil-Military Relations Theory and Feaver's principal-agent model. The focus of the study was on reaching those respondents that have knowhow on civil-military cooperation especially on the Somalia conflict. The study focused on civil-military actors like the military, police, humanitarian workers and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs). This study employed an ex-post facto research design. The ex-post facto research was suitable for this study because the civilmilitary cooperation has already been undertaken to mitigate on the conflict in Somalia. The target population comprised of the views of experts and stakeholders involved in fostering for peace in Somalia. These views were collected from journal and articles about Somalia. The study was a desktop review of journals and articles on civil-military cooperation in Somalia.

#### 5.3 Conclusions

The study concluded that the three null hypotheses were rejected. Chapter two focused on the concept of civil-military cooperation and success involved in civil-military cooperation. The null hypothesis was that there is no significant success of civil-military actors in conflict resolution in Somalia. The concept of civil-military cooperation was defined as the nature of the understanding between the civilian and military institutions during period of conflicts. Civil-military relations were seen as encompassing activities undertaken to establish and maintain relations between military forces and civil authorities as well as the general population. Civil-military cooperation has arisen due to the trend of increased frequency and scale of natural disasters in many areas of the world. The study established that the success of civil-military relations in Somalia is notable from growing complexity of operational requirements where neighbouring states are increasingly recognizing and intensifying working relationship between military and civilian actors. The study also expressed the success emanating from the fact that post-Cold War has ushered in a new relationship between the military and civilian organization actors as witnessed in Somalia due to complicated ethnic maelstrom characterized by mass murder, massive civil displacement based on mutual violence and revenge. The null hypothesis was thus rejected.

Chapter three highlighted the role of the civil-military relations in Somalia. The null hypothesis was that there is no significant role of the civil-military relations for the overall

political resolution in Somalia. The chapter has started by highlighting the conflict situation in Somalia and the attempts by civil-military approaches to pacify and salvage the humanitarian crisis in the country. The role of actors such as the Government of Kenya and Ethiopia which have repeatedly sent military forces into Somalia to counter terrorist groups was established. Additionally, the role and effort of international support for Somalia government led by allied militia and AMISOM was established. More importantly, the study captured the role of the United Nations Security Council, the African Union, and the Intergovernmental Authority for Development (IGAD) and East Africa Community attempts at scaling down the threat of Al-Shabaab and support to the Somalia government. Finally, the study gave a detailed attempt by International NGOs and Aid Agencies and IGAD to mobilize support and resources for the Government of Somalia. The null hypothesis was thus rejected.

Chapter four attempted to establish the challenges faced by civil-military actors in Somalia. The null hypothesis was that there are no significant challenges faced by civil-military cooperation actors in Somalia. The study established that emergence of state and non-state actors like NGOs and even private military and security companies, has posed the challenge of increased frequency of peacekeeping operations in Somalia calling for different set of capabilities within the military. Another challenge is that the threat of global terrorism as witnessed by rise of Al-shabaab in Somalia is both an internal and external matter and therefore requires greater cooperation between civil-military actors. The other challenge for civil-military relations is due to the fact that, civilian government of Somalia is unable to fully cooperate with the military in an attempt to use its expert advice adequately. Again, the use of humanitarian assistance for political or military gain in Somalia is entirely contrary to

the concept of humanitarian action, which should be exclusively humanitarian and impartial in nature. Finally, misunderstanding involving the military and humanitarian actor may be heightened by the mandate provide by such players like the United Nations to the foreign forces in a conflict.

#### 5.4 **Recommendations**

The study recommended that that the success of civil-military actors in conflict resolution in Somalia should be scaled up to fully coordinate and utilize the capability of the actors currently in place. This is due to the fact that through civil-military cooperation, the military and civilian organizations will mutually benefit in the attempts at pacifying the threats in Somalia by accommodating the strengths of each other.

The study recommended that civil-military relations in Somalia are very essential for the overall political resolution in Somalia. Therefore the efforts of actors such as the Government of Kenya and Ethiopia, United Nations, African Union, IGAD) and East Africa Community should be continued as an attempt at scaling down the threat of Al-Shabaab and support to the Somalia government. The study recommended that efforts should be undertaken by the various actors in the Somalia conflict to overcome the challenges facing civil-military actors. Appropriate measures should be put in place to streamline the mandate of these actors for establishment of appropriate level of interaction.

# 5.5 Area for Further Research

- A study should be undertaken to establish the challenges of civil-military relations in Somalia.
- 2. The study on the impact of civil-military cooperation on the conflict of Somalia should be generalized to cover the conflict in South Sudan.

#### REFERENCES

- Ahmad, J.K., Devarajan, S., Khemani, S., and Shah, S., (2005). Decentralization and Service Delivery. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper No. 3603.
- Alford, J. & O'Flynn J (2009). Making sense of public value: concepts, critiques and emergent meanings, *International Journal of Public Administration*, 32(3&4): 171-191.
- Angstrom, Jan. (2013). The changing norms of civil and military and civil-military relations theory, Small Wars & Insurgencies, 24:2, 224-236.
- Arnstein, Sherry R. 1969. A Ladder of Citizen Participation. Journal of the American Institute of Planners, 35(3): 216-224.
- Barakat, S., S. Deely, S. & Zyck, A. (2010). A Tradition of Forgetting: Stabilization and Humanitarian Action in Historical Perspective', *Disasters*, *34*(*S3*).
- Bogdan, R. C., & Biklen, S. K. (2007). *Qualitative research for education: An introduction to theories and methods (5th Ed.).* Boston: Pearson Education.
- Brinkerhoff, D.W., Brinkerhoff, J.M., & Mcnulty, S., (2007). Decentralization and Participatory Local Governance: A Decision Space Analysis and Decision Space. New York.
- Brooks, J. (2015). Challenges of Civil-Military Engagement in Humanitarian Action: An Overview. *International Peacekeeping*, *18* (4), 234-235.
- Chitere, P., & Ireri, O., (2008). District Focus for Rural Development as a Decentralized Planning Strategy: An Assessment of its implementation in Kenya. In: Kibua, T.N. &
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morison, K. (2008). *Research Methods in Education*. London: Routledge Falmer.
- Collinson, S. & Elhawary, S. (2012). Humanitarian Space: A Review of Trends and Issues, HPG Report 32. London: ODI.
- Cooper, D. R. & Schindler P.S. (2011). Marketing Research. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Desch, M. C. (2009). *Civilian Control of the Military. The changing security environment.* Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Diamond, L., & Plattner, M. F. (Eds.). (1996). *Civil-military relations and democracy*. JHU Press.

- Eriksson, M. (2013). Somalia's Civil War, Security Promotion and National Interest. Swedish Defense Research Agency FOI-R--3718—SE. ISSN 1650-1942. Mainstay of defense
- Fallows, R. (2009). Peace Operations. Negotiation Journal, 1 (1), 4-9
- Fishtein, P. (2010). Winning Hearts and Minds? Examining the Relationship between Aid and Security in Afghanistan's Balkh Province. Medford, MA: Feinstein International Center, Tufts University.
- Fitch, J. Samuel, A. (1998). *The Armed Forces and Democracy in Latin America*. Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Franke, S. (2006). The peace-building dilemma: civil-military cooperation in stability operations. *International Journal of Peace Studies*, 11 (2), 1-2
- Garrett, M. (2013). Somalia: Gaining Momentum in a War-Torn State. Journal of Global Development and Peace, 1 (2), 2-3
- Hammond, L. & Lindley, A. (2014). *Histories and contemporary challenges of Somalia crisis and mobility*. Abingdon: Routledge.
- Harper, M. (2012). *Getting Somalia Wrong*. International African Institute. The Royal African Society and Social Research Council, Cynthia Street. London.
- Haysom, S. & Jackson, A. (2013). 'You don't need to love us': Civil-Military Relations in Afghanistan, 2002–13. Stability: *International Journal of Security & Development*, 2(2), 1-16.
- Heiberg, L. (2010). Civil-Military Relations in Uganda. Trykk: Reprosentralen, Universitetet i Oslo.
- Huntington, S. P. (2010). Reforming Civil-Military Relations. *Journal of Democracy*. 6.4 pp 9-17.
- Janjua, W. (2010). Civil-Military Relations: The Impact of Internal and External Factors in Shaping the Balance of Civil and Military Power. *NDU Journal*, 1 (1), 26-27.
- Jayasundara-Smits, D. Shyamika, M. (2016). Time to Bite the Bullet: Fostering Civilmilitary Synergy in EU Crisis Management and Peacebuilding Operations (Unpublished) <u>https://www.researchgate.net/publication/308163254</u>. Accessed 17 May 2018.
- Kerlinger, S. (1998). Research Methods for Business Students (5<sup>th</sup> ed.). Italy: Pearson Education Limited.
- Khalid, Z. (2015). The Importance of Healthy Civil-Military Relations for Effective National Security. Pakistan Insider, pg. 1-2
- Kothari, C.K. (2008). *Research Methodology: Methods And Techniques 2nd Edition Revised*. New Delhi: New Age International Limited Publishers

- Krahenbuhl, P. (2011). *The Militarization of Aid and Its Perils*, ICRC Resource Center Online, http://www.icrc.org.
- Lambert, A. (2011). From civil-military relations towards security sector government. *European Political Science*, 10 (2), 234-235
- Macdermott, J. & Hanssen, M. (2010). Protection of Civilians: Delivering on the Mandate through Civil–Military Coordination, Swedish Defence Research Agency.
- Metcalfe, V., Giffen, A. & Elhawary, S. (2011.). UN Integration and Humanitarian Space: An Independent Study Commissioned by the UN Integration Steering Group, HPG and Stimson Center.
- Metcalfe, V., Giffen, A., & Elhawary, s. (2011). *UN Integration and Humanitarian Space:* An Independent Study Commissioned by the UN Integration Steering Group, HPG and Stimson Center.
- Metcalfe, V., Haysom, S., & Gordon, S. (2012). Trends and challenges in humanitarian civilmilitary coordination: A review of the literature. *London: The Humanitarian Policy Group*.
- Msila, V., & Setlhako, A. (2013). Evaluation of Programs: Reading Carol H. Weiss. University of South Africa, College of Education, Department of Education Leadership and Management. Pretoria, South Africa: Horizon Research Publishing.
- Mwabu, G. eds., (2008). *Decentralization and Devolution in Kenya: New Approaches*. Nairobi: University of Nairobi Press. Pp. 9-46
- OCHA, (2011). Report of the Annual Meeting of the Consultative Group on the Use of Military and Civil Defense Assets (MCDA), Geneva, 21–22 November.
- Odowa, A. M. (2013). What can current leaders in Somalia learn from their past history. *The ITPCM International Commentary*, 9, (34), 19-23.
- Onditi, F. & Okoth, P. G. (2016). Civil-Military Relations and the African Standby Forces' Multi-dimensions, *Journal of African Conflicts and Peace Studies*: Vol. 3: Iss. 1,
- Oxfam (2011). Whose Aid Is It Anyway? Politicizing Aid in Conflicts and Crises, Oxfam International.
- Rubinstein, R. (2008). Cross-Cultural Considerations in Complex Peace Operations. Negotiation Journal, 19 (1), 29-49
- Sabala, K. (2011). *Regional and extra-regional inputs in promoting security in Somalia*. Pretoria: Institute for Security Studies.
- Schmied, C. (2015). What are the challenges posed by civil-military cooperation and to what extent can they be overcome? *Small Arms and Insurgencies*, 24 (2), 234-235.

- SCHR (Steering Committee on humanitarian Response), (2010). Position Paper on Humanitarian–Military Relations, http://reliefweb.int.
- Segui, N.R. (2013). PSC Rétrospective. Appraising the role of the AU in Somalia", Issue No. 42 ISS Peace and Security Council report No.8.
- Slim, H. (2011). NGO–Military Contact Group: Keynote Address, Conference on Civil– Military Relations in Natural Disasters: New Developments from the Field, 12 October.
- Uniting Our Strengths for Peace, (2015). Politics, Partnership, and People, *Report of the High-Level Independent Panel on UN Peace Operations*.
- Wilder, A. (2009). Losing Hearts and Minds in Afghanistan', Viewpoints Special Edition, Afghanistan, 1979-2009: In the Grip of Conflict', Middle East Institute, Washington DC.