

**ACCESS TO JUSTICE IN ENVIRONMENTAL DISPUTE RESOLUTION: TOWARDS
THE REALIZATION OF SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT**

MASTER OF LAWS PROJECT PAPER

HELLEN SERUYA WASILWA

REGISTRATION NUMBER G62/8098/2006


**A Project paper submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
award of Master of Laws (LLM) Degree of the University of Nairobi**

NAIROBI

NOVEMBER 2009

DECLARATION

I, Hellen Seruya Wasilwa, do declare that this is my original work and has not been submitted for a degree in any other university.

Signed 

HELLEN SERUYA WASILWA

REGISTRATION NUMBER: G62/8098/2006

Date 20th November 2009.

This Project Paper is submitted for examination with my approval as University Supervisor

Name: Prof Albert Mumma

Professor of Law

P.O. Box 30197

NAIROBI.

Signed; 

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This project paper would not have been possible without the selfless assistance of some people I would like to mention here.

First and foremost is the Almighty God who gave me life and therefore an opportunity to write this paper. Others who are also valued are my dear husband **Saul** for financial and moral support.

I must acknowledge my supervisor **Professor Albert Mumma** who assisted in formulating my disjointed ideas into a coherent manuscript. He encouraged me to move on searching for more ideas which are herein. Without his patience and availability I would not have been able to complete this thesis. Others are my law lecturers who imparted knowledge in environmental law that made me grasp the concepts in this paper.

I also wish to acknowledge my son **Michael** the computer whiz who constantly repaired my computer when it had issues and did the layout of this paper and also , my research assistant **Denis Seko** who constantly ran around to get me some information from different government offices which formed part of the information herein.

ALL OF YOU and others not mentioned, thank you very much and God bless you richly.

DEDICATION

To my dear husband Saul and our ten bundles of joy;- Clarence, Princess, Anita, Arnold, Vera, Sheila, Mercy, Hellen, Michael and Faith-Peter.

LIST OF ACRONYMS

CBD	Convention on Biodiversity
CITES	Convention on International Trade on Endangered Species
DEC	District Environment Committees
DNPE	Draft National Policy on Environment.
EAC	East African Community
EC	European Commission
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessments
EIAR	Environmental Impact Assessment Report
EMCA	Environmental Management and Coordination Act
ENGOS	Environmental Non-Government Organizations
ESD	Environmental Sustainable Development
EU	European Union
GoK	Government of Kenya
KWS	Kenya Wildlife Service
KWSTI	Kenya Wildlife Service Training Institute
LAT	Land Arbitration Tribunal
LSK	Law Society of Kenya
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals

MW&I	Ministry of Water and Irrigation
MENR	Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources
MEAs	Multilateral Environmental Agreements
NET	National Environment Tribunal
NLP	National Land Policy
NSWCP	National Soil and Water Conservation Programme
NEC	National Environment Council
NEMA	National Environment Management Authority
NEPAD	New Partnership for African Development
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
PCC	Public Complaints Committee
PEC	Provincial Environment Committees
NEAP	The National Environment Action Plan
UN	United Nations
UNCCD	United Nations Convention to Combat Desertification
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law the Sea
UNEP	United Nations Development Programme
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
WAB	Water Appeal Board

WCED	World Commission on Environment and Development
WRMA	Water Resources Management Authority
WSB	Water Services Board
WSRB	Water Services Regulatory Board
WHO	World Health Organization
WCMD	Wildlife Conservation and Management Department
WCN	World Charter for Nature
WCED	World Commission on Environment and Development
WSSD	World Summit on Sustainable Development

LIST OF STATUTES

- Anticorruption and Economic Crimes Act, Act no. 3 of 2003
- Arbitration (Amendment) Bill, 2009, Bill No.2,
- Biosafety Bill, 2008
- Civil Procedure Act, Cap. 21, Laws of Kenya
- Environmental Management and Co-ordination Act, Act No. 8 of 1999
- Evidence Act, Cap. 80, laws of Kenya
- Government Lands Act Cap 280, Laws of Kenya
- Judicature Act, cap 8 laws of Kenya
- Labour Institutions Act, 2007
- Law Society of Kenya Act, Cap 18 laws of Kenya
- Local Government Act, Chapter 265, Laws of Kenya
- Public Health Act, cap 242 laws of Kenya
- Societies act, cap 108, laws of Kenya
- The constitution of Kenya
- The Forests Act, Cap. 7 of 2005
- The Wildlife (Conservation and Management) Act of 1976
- Water Act, Act No. 8 of 2002

LIST OF CASES

Gerisson Mwiti vs. Nairobi City Water and Sewerage Company Limited, W.S. *Appeal no. 4 of 2008*

Giella vs. Cassman Brown [1973] *EA 358*

Gouriet vs Union of Post Office Workers, (1978) *AC 435*

Gupta vs Union of India, AIR 1982 *SC 149*.

Jamii Bora Trust case, *Tribunal Appeal No. NET/02/03/2005*

Kabere M'mbijiwe vs Tana Water Services Board, *Appeal No 3 W.S 2009*

Kararapon Vs Olepolos Water Project, *Appeal no. 3 W. R 2008*

Keinya Water Project Society vs Nganderi Nganda Water Consumer Society, *APPEAL NO. 1 W.S 2008*

Kenafic Industries case, NET *Tribunal at Nairobi, Tribunal Referral Case No. 08/2006*

Law Society Of Kenya vs Commissioner Of Lands & 2 Others, (2001) *1 KLR (E&L) 456*

Law Society Of Kenya vs Commissioner Of Lands & 2 Others, (2003) *1 KLR (E&L) 535*

Malindi Green Town Residents Association case, High Court in Mombasa H.C. *C.C Misc Appli No. 391 of 2006*

Mr. Jonah Gbemre vs Shell Petroleum Development Company Ltd, Nigeria National Petroleum Corporation and the AG of the Federation, *High court of Nigeria in the Benin Judicial Division Holden at Court Benin City. Suit No. FHC/B/CS/153/05*

Ms Shehla Zia and others vs WAPDA, *PLD 1994 Supreme Court 693*

Nakumatt Holdings Ltd vs NEMA and Anor, *National Environmental Tribunal at Nairobi Tribunal Appeal No. NET01/02.2005*

Ndukuruma Water And Sanitation Service Provider vs. Northern Water Services Board, *Appeal No. 1 W. S. 2009*

NEMA V Richard Michael Ashley, *H.C.C.C Nairobi Misc. Appli. 1222 of 2005*

Park View Shopping Arcade Ltd v. Charles Kangethe & 2 Others, *HCCC No. 438 of 2004*

Peter K Waweru and Republic, *High Court of Kenya, at Nairobi. Misc. Civil Application No, 118 of 2004*

Peter Kinuthia Mwaniki and 2 others versus Peter Njuguna Gicheha and 3 others, *High Court of Kenya at Nairobi. Civil Suit No. 313 of 2000*

Peter Kinuthia Mwaniki V Peter Njuguna Gicheha Limuru Butchers Union and 2 others, *Nairobi HCCC No. 313 of 2000 at page 18-19 (1990) 170 CLR 534 at pg 566-7.*

Rafiki Enterprises Ltd –vs.- Afrison Export Import Limited & Nairobi City Council, *Kenya Court of Appeal, Civil Appeal No 174 of 2008*

Republic V NEMA and Richard Michael Ashley, *H.CCC Misc. Civil Appl. 1222 of 2005*

Rodgers Mwema Nzioka and 2 others vs Tiomin Kenya Limited, High Court of Kenya at Mombasa. Civil Case No. 97 of 2001

Rural Litigation and Entitlement Kendra, Dehradun vs State of Uttar Pradesh, AIR 1988(Him Prad) 4

Samson Lereya and 800 others V the Attorney General and 2 others, Nairobi HCCC No. 115 of 2006. Reported in (2006) eKLR

Shah Vershi Devshi v. Transport Licensing Board [1971] E.A. 289

Sylvia C Endere vs. Karen Roses Ltd, High Court of Kenya At Nakuru Civil case no. 298 OF 2005

Vellore Citizens Welfare Forum vs Union of India, PLD 1994 SC 693

Wangari Maathai vs Kenya Times Media Trust, Nairobi High Court Civil Case No. 5403 of 1989

Wangari Maathai-vs-Kenya Times Media Trust, HCCC No 72 of 1994 [unreported]

LIST OF INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS

Aarhus Convention

Convention on Biodiversity (CBD)

Convention on International Trade on Endangered Species (CITES)

Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer,

New Partnership for African Development NEPAD

Protocol for Sustainable Development of Lake Victoria Basin

Ramsar Convention

Stockholm Convention on Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPS)

UN Convention to Combat Desertification (UNCCD)

UN Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC)

United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea

Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION	I
DEDICATIONS	III
LIST OF ACRONYMS	IV
LIST OF STATUTES	VII
LIST OF CASES	VIII
LIST OF INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS	XI
CHAPTER ONE	15
1.0 INTRODUCTION	15
1.1 BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY	15
1.2 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM	20
1.3 OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY	22
1.3.1. <i>General objective</i>	23
1.3.2. <i>Specific objectives</i>	23
1.4. JUSTIFICATION OF THE STUDY	23
1.5 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	26
1.6. HYPOTHESIS	27
1.7. THEORETICAL/CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK	27
1.8. LITERATURE REVIEW	57
1.9. CHAPTER BREAKDOWN	68
CHAPTER TWO	72
ENVIRONMENTAL LAW AND POLICY FRAMEWORK AND IT'S EFFECT ON ACCESS TO JUSTICE IN KENYA.....	72
2.1 INTRODUCTION	72
2.2 THE LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW	74
2.2.1. <i>The Stockholm Declaration on the Human Environment</i>	75
2.2.2. <i>The World Charter for Nature</i>	76
2.2.3. <i>The Rio Declaration</i>	77
2.2.4. <i>Agenda 21</i>	78
2.2.5. <i>The Memorandum of Understanding between Kenya, Tanzania and Uganda for Co-operation on environmental management</i>	80
2.3. THE LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN KENYA: THE NATIONAL SET-UP	83
2.3.1. <i>The Constitution</i>	83
2.3.2. <i>Environmental Management and Coordination Act, 1999</i>	86
2.3.3. <i>Other Sectoral laws regulating the environment</i>	92
2.4 ENVIRONMENTAL POLICY FRAMEWORK IN KENYA	99
2.4.1 <i>Key Policy issues</i>	101
2.4.2 <i>Goal and Objectives of the National Environment Policy</i>	102
2.5 CONCLUSION	103
CHAPTER 3.....	104

3.0. INSTITUTIONS FOR RESOLUTION OF ENVIRONMENTAL DISPUTES IN KENYA AND THEIR EFFECT ON ACCESS TO ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE..... 104

3.1 INTRODUCTION	104
3.2 COURTS AS INSTITUTIONS FOR SOLVING ENVIRONMENTAL DISPUTES.	105
3.2.1 <i>Case law on environmental litigation in Kenya</i>	111
3.2.2. <i>Case law in other jurisdictions</i>	115
3.3 COURT’S HANDLING OF ISSUES OF LOCUS STANDI AND COSTS IN ENVIRONMENTAL DISPUTE RESOLUTION PROCESS.....	117
3.4 COSTS IN ENVIRONMENTAL DISPUTE RESOLUTION.....	121
3.4.1 <i>Conclusion</i>	123
3.5 TRIBUNALS AS INSTITUTIONS FOR SOLVING ENVIRONMENTAL DISPUTES	124
3.5.1 <i>What then are Tribunals?</i>	125
3.5.2 <i>National Environment Tribunal, (NET)</i>	126
3.5.3. <i>Conclusion</i>	131
3.6 WATER APPEAL BOARD	132
3.6.1 <i>Conclusion</i>	134
3.7 LAND ARBITRATION TRIBUNAL.....	135
3.7.1 <i>Conclusion</i>	136

CHAPTER FOUR..... 137

INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF ENVIRONMENTAL LAWS..... 137

4.0 INTRODUCTION	137
4.1 STAFF CAPACITY	138
4.2 LEVEL OF COORDINATION BETWEEN SECTORAL INSTITUTIONS	140
4.2.1 <i>Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources</i>	140
4.2.2 <i>Jurisdictional Issues</i>	141
4.3 TOWARDS ENFORCEMENT AND EXECUTION OF ENVIRONMENTAL ORDERS IN KENYA	142
4.3.1 <i>Need for Good Governance in Environmental Law Enforcement</i>	142
4.3.2 <i>Public Participation</i>	143
4.3.3 <i>Public Awareness of Environmental Issues and of Legal Enforcement Mechanisms</i>	143
4.4 JUDICIAL TRAINING	144
4.5 CRITIQUE TO THE TRIBUNAL (NET)	145
4.6 NEED FOR ENVIRONMENTAL COURTS.....	148
4.7 CONCLUSIONS	149

CHAPTER FIVE..... 151

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS 151

5.0 INTRODUCTION	151
5.1 FINDINGS.....	151
5.1.1 <i>The Courts and the Environment</i>	151
5.1.2 <i>Sectoral legislations</i>	154
5.1. 3 <i>EMCA</i>	154
5.1.4 <i>The Role of the Judiciary in Promoting Environmental Compliance and Sustainable Development</i>	156
5.1.5 <i>The National Environmental Tribunal (NET)</i>	159

5.2 RECOMMENDATIONS..... 161

5.2.1 Collection and dissemination of environmental information.....	161
5.2.2 Access to justice with regard to standing.....	163
5.2.3 Environmental impact assessment	164
5.2.4 Use of ADR Mechanisms	164
5.2.5 National Environment Tribunal (NET)	165
5.3 CONCLUSION	165
BIBLIOGRAPHY AND REFERENCES.....	169