

**TODAY AND BEYOND: DETERMINING THE MOST APPROPRIATE
FORUM FOR ENSURING JUSTICE FOR PERPETRATORS AND
VICTIMS OF KENYA'S POST ELECTIONS VIOLENCE OF 2007
- A CRITIQUE**

BY

DANIEL OWINO KONYANGO

**A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE
REQUIREMENTS FOR THE AWARD OF THE DEGREE OF MASTER
OF LAWS (LL.M.) OF THE UNIVERSITY OF NAIROBI**

NAIROBI

OCTOBER, 2010

DECLARATION

I, **DANIEL OWINO KONYANGO**, do hereby declare that this is my original work and that it has not been submitted for a degree in any other university.

Signed: _____


DANIEL OWINO KONYANGO

This Thesis has been submitted for an examination with my approval as the University Supervisor.

Signed: _____


PROF. F.D.P. SITUMA

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my heartfelt gratitude to my Supervisor, Professor F.D.P. Situma, for his invaluable support and guidance in the process of writing this thesis. Particularly, I would like to appreciate his dedication to my course and interest in developing this work from an initially ill-fitting set of ideas from myself, to the fine piece that it has ended up being. I shall not forget Professor's keenness on detail and scholarly perfection that I came to see him exhibit in the course of supervising this work. God Bless you Professor.

I am equally grateful to the other members of the Panel that examined my oral presentation of this thesis: Ms. Joy Asiema, the Reader for the Panel, and Mr. William Musyoka who chaired the Panel, for their useful observations and directions that added much value to the final version of the work.

To my two girls, Eunny and Jewell, thank you for the patience with which you bore my absence, on account of pursuing the LL.M. course.

DEDICATION

To my brother Boniface, who lost his 15 years work and investment to the post election violence in Naivasha in January 2008.

And to all victims of the post election violence.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION.....	i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	ii
DEDICATION.....	iii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	viii
LIST OF STATUTES.....	x
LIST OF INTERNATIONAL CASES.....	xi
LIST OF LOCAL CASES.....	xii
LIST OF CONVENTIONS AND OTHER INTERNATIONAL LEGAL INSTRUMENTS.....	xiii
 CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION.....	 1
1.1 Overview.....	1
1.2 Background to the Research Problem.....	4
1.3 Statement of the Problem.....	7
1.4 Research Questions.....	8
1.4.1 The Main Question.....	8
1.4.2 Other Questions.....	8
1.5 Objectives of the study.....	8
1.5.1 The main objective.....	8
1.5.2 Specific objectives.....	9
1.6 Hypotheses.....	9
1.7 Conceptual Framework.....	9
1.8 Literature Review.....	16
1.9 Justification for the study.....	23
1.10 Methodology.....	24
 CHAPTER TWO: PRINCIPLES OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW.....	 25
2.1 Introduction	25
2.1.1 The Concept of Crime under International Law.....	27
2.1.2 The Context of Organised Violence.....	27
2.2 The Question of Jurisdiction of the ICC.....	28
2.2.1 Jurisdiction over subject matter (<i>ratione materiae</i>)	28
2.2.2 Temporal jurisdiction (<i>ratione temporis</i>)	29
2.2.3 Territorial jurisdiction (<i>ratione loci</i>)	29
2.2.4 Personal jurisdiction (<i>ratione personae</i>)	30
2.3 The Question of Admissibility of a Case before the ICC.....	31
2.4 Sources of Law for the ICC.....	34
2.4.1 The ICC Statute, Elements of Crime, Rules of Procedure and Evidence	34
2.4.2 International Treaties	34
2.4.3 Customary International Law.....	35
2.4.4 General Principles of Law.....	35
2.4.5 National Laws	35
2.4.6 Previous Decisions of the Court.....	36
2.5 Elements of Crime under International Law.....	37

2.5.1	<i>Actus reus</i>	37
2.5.1.1	Commission.....	39
2.5.1.2	Encouragement.....	40
2.5.1.3	Assistance.....	40
2.5.1.4	Superior Responsibility.....	41
2.5.2	<i>Mens rea</i>	43
2.5.2.1	Intent and Knowledge.....	44
2.5.2.2	Other specific provisions for <i>mens rea</i>	45
2.5.2.2.1	Other specific provisions in the Statute.....	45
2.5.2.2.2	The Elements of Crime.....	46
2.5.2.2.3	Rules of Customary International Law.....	46
2.5.2.2.4	Context of the Crime	47
2.5.2.2.5	Recklessness and <i>dolus eventualis</i>	47
2.5.3	Inchoate crimes.....	48
2.5.3.1	Conspiracy.....	48
2.5.3.3	Planning and Preparation.....	49
2.5.3.4	Attempts.....	49
2.6	Defences against Criminal Responsibility under International Law..	50
2.6.1	Self Defence.....	50
2.6.2	Necessity and Duress.....	51
2.6.3	Mistake.....	52
2.6.4	Superior Orders.....	53
2.6.5	Mental Disease/Defect.....	53
2.6.6	Intoxication.....	54
2.6.7	Other Possible Defences.....	55
2.7	Immunity and Official Capacity.....	55
2.8	Conclusion.....	56
CHAPTER THREE: CRIMES AGAINST HUMANITY.....		58
3.1	The history of crimes against humanity.....	58
3.2	The crimes.....	59
3.3	A civilian population.....	59
3.4	Widespread or systematic attack.....	62
3.5	Perpetrators of crimes against humanity.....	64
3.6	Mental element for crimes against humanity.....	64
3.7	Individual Acts Constituting Crimes against Humanity.....	66
3.7.1	Killing.....	66
3.7.2	Extermination.....	67
3.7.3	Enslavement.....	67
3.7.4	Deportation or forcible transfer of population.....	68
3.7.5	Imprisonment or other severe deprivation of physical liberty.....	69
3.7.6	Torture.....	69
3.7.7	Sexual Violence.....	70
3.7.7.1	Rape	70
3.7.7.2	Sexual slavery.....	71
3.7.7.3	Enforced prostitution.....	71
3.7.7.4	Forced pregnancy.....	71
3.7.7.5	Enforced sterilization.....	71
3.7.7.6	Other acts of sexual violence.....	72

3.7.8	Persecution.....	72
3.7.9	Enforced disappearance.....	74
3.7.10	Apartheid.....	74
3.7.11	Other inhumane acts.....	75
3.8	Conclusion.....	75

CHAPTER FOUR: THE OPTION OF THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT.....77

4.1	Introduction	77
4.2	Challenges related to investigation and evidence before the Court.....	77
4.3	Challenges relating to the procedure at the Court.....	80
4.4	Challenges relating to operations of the Court.....	84
4.4.1	Witness protection.....	84
4.4.2	Translations.....	84
4.4.3	The use of intermediaries in the ICC.....	85
4.4.4	What is the impact of these possible delays?	87
4.5	How many can be prosecuted?	90
4.6	Sentencing by the International Criminal Court.....	91
4.7	Conclusion.....	92

CHAPTER FIVE: THE OPTION OF A SPECIAL TRIBUNAL.....94

5.1	Introduction	94
5.2	Justification for a Special Tribunal.....	94
5.2.1	Control of the Judiciary by the Executive.....	96
5.2.2	Funding.....	97
5.2.3	Corruption.....	97
5.2.4	Backlog of cases.....	98
5.2.5	The judiciary is ill equipped and weak	99
5.2.6	The powers of the Attorney General	102
5.2.7	Immunity of the President	103
5.2.8	Principle of retrospectivity.....	104
5.2.9	Poor investigations by the Police.....	104
5.3	The legal foundations for the Special Tribunal.....	106
5.4	Laws applicable by the Tribunal.....	107
5.5	Composition of the Tribunal	108
5.5.1	The Trial Chamber.....	108
5.5.2	The Appeals Chamber.....	108
5.5.3	The Special Magistrates' Courts.....	109
5.5.4	The Prosecutor.....	109
5.5.5	The Registrar.....	109
5.5.6	The Defence Office.....	110
5.6	Comparative study with the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia and the Special Court for Sierra Leone.....	111
5.6.1	The Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia.....	112
5.6.1.1	Background.....	112
5.6.2	The Special Court for Sierra Leone.....	115
5.6.2.1	Background	115

5.6.2.2	Jurisdiction of the Special Court.....	116
5.7	Challenges that may face the Special Tribunal for Kenya.....	120
5.8	Conclusion	122

CHAPTER SIX: THE KENYAN LEGAL REGIME..... 124

6.1	Introduction.....	124
6.2	The Kenyan Law with Regard to the Crimes under the Rome Statute.....	125
6.3	The New Constitution and Composition of the Kenyan Judiciary...	127
6.4	Prosecuting the crimes of post election violence before the Kenyan judiciary.....	132
6.5	Kenyan Legal Regime for Transitional Justice	135
6.5.1	The Truth, Justice and Reconciliation Commission.....	137
6.5.2	Avenues for the Achievement of Transitional Justice in Kenya.....	140
6.5.2.1	Reconciliation.....	140
6.5.2.2	Amnesty.....	140
6.5.2.3	Reparations	141
6.5.2.4	Lustration.....	142
6.5.2.5	Memorialization	143
6.5.3	Challenges facing the TJRC process.....	143
6.6	Conclusion.....	144

CHAPTER SEVEN: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS..... 146

7.1	Introduction	146
7.2	Conclusion	146
7.3	Recommendations.....	153

BIBLIOGRAPHY:..... 157

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AG	-	Attorney General
CDF	-	Civilian Defense Forces
CIPEV	-	Commission of Inquiry into the Post-Election Violence
CREAW	-	Centre for Rights Education and Awareness
ECK	-	Electoral Commission of Kenya
FIDA (Kenya)	-	The Federation of Women Lawyers (Kenya Chapter)
FPLC	-	<i>Forces Patriotiques pour la Libération du Congo</i> [Patriotic Forces for the Liberation of Congo]
GA	-	The General Assembly of the United Nations
HRW	-	Human Rights Watch
ICC	-	International Criminal Court
ICRC	-	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR	-	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	-	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
ID	-	Investigations Division
IIEC	-	Interim Independent Electoral Commission
IMT	-	International Military Tribunal
IRRC	-	International Review of the Red Cross
JCCD	-	Jurisdiction, Complementarily and Co-operation Division
JEM	-	Justice and Equality Movement
K LR	-	Kenya Law Reports
KANU	-	Kenya African National Union
KNCHR	-	Kenya National Commission on Human Rights
MGS Haskanita	-	Haskanita Military Group Site
NARC	-	National Rainbow Coalition
ODM	-	Orange Democratic Movement
OR	-	Ordinary Resolution
PD	-	Prosecution Division
PNU	-	Party of National Unity
RUF	-	Revolutionary United Front
SC	-	The Security Council of the United Nations

TFV	-	Trust Fund for Victims
TJRC	-	Truth, Justice and Reconciliation Commission
UN	-	United Nations
UNFPA	-	United Nations Population Fund
UNICEF	-	United Nations Children's Fund
UNIFEM	-	United Nations Development Fund for Women
UNTS	-	United Nations Treaty Series

LIST OF STATUTES

Kenyan Constitutions

1. The 1963 Constitution.
2. The 2010 Constitution.

Kenyan Statutes

1. International Crimes Act, No. 16 of 2008.
2. Law Reform Act, Cap. 26, Laws of Kenya (Revised Edition, 1981).
3. National Accord and Reconciliation Act, No. 4 of 2008.
4. National Assembly and Presidential Elections Act Cap. 7, Laws of Kenya (Revised Edition, 1998).
5. National Cohesion and Integration Act, No. 12 of 2008.
6. Sexual Offences Act, No. 3 of 2006.
7. The Commissions of Inquiry Act Cap. 102, Laws of Kenya (Revised Edition, 1981).
8. The Penal Code Cap. 63, Laws of Kenya (Revised Edition, 2008).
9. Truth, Justice and Reconciliation Act, No. 6 of 2008.

Sierra Leonean Statute

1. Special Court Agreement, 2002 (Ratification) Act, No. 9 of 2002 (*Supplement to the Sierra Leone Gazette Vol. CXXXIII No. 22, 25th April 2002*).

Kenyan Bill

1. Special Tribunal for Kenya Bill- (*Kenya Gazette Supplement No. 7 of 2009*).

LIST OF INTERNATIONAL CASES

1. Attorney General of Israel vs. Eichmann, (1968), 36 *ILR* (District Court)
2. The Prosecutor vs. Akayesu, *ICTR-96-4*
3. The Prosecutor vs. Aleksovski, *IT-95-14-A*
4. The Prosecutor vs. Bahar Idriss Abu Garda, *ICC-02/05-02/09*
5. The Prosecutor vs. Blaskic, *IT-95-14-T*
6. The Prosecutor vs. Erdemovic, *IT-96-22-A*
7. The Prosecutor vs. Jean Pierre Bemba Gombo, *ICC-01/05/08*
8. The Prosecutor vs. Krnojelac, *IT-97-25-A*
9. The Prosecutor vs. Krstic, *IT-98-33-T*
10. The Prosecutor vs. Kunarac, *IT-96-23-A*
11. The Prosecutor vs. Kupreskic, *IT-95-16-T*
12. The Prosecutor vs. Mucic, *IT-96-21-A*
13. The Prosecutor vs. Musema, *ICTR-96-13-T*
14. The Prosecutor vs. Nahimana, *ICTR-96-11*
15. The Prosecutor vs. Naletilic & Martinovic, *IT-98-34-T*
16. The Prosecutor vs. Tadic, *IT-94-1-A*
17. The Prosecutor vs. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, *ICC-01/04-01/06*
18. The Prosecutor vs. Vasiljevic, *IT-98-32-A*

LIST OF LOCAL CASES

1. Gibson Kamau Kuria vs. The Hon. Attorney General, *High Court Miscellaneous Civil Case No. 551 of 1988 (unreported)*
2. Maina Mbacha vs. The Hon. Attorney General, *High Court Miscellaneous Civil Case No. 356 of 1989(unreported)*
3. Masinde Muliro vs. The Hon. Attorney General, *High Court Miscellaneous Civil Case No. 264 of 1989(unreported)*
4. Naulilaa Case, (Portugal vs. Germany); 2 *R.I.A.A.*, (1928)
5. Republic vs. Anarita Karimi Njeru, *Criminal Appeal No. 4 of 1979, (No.1), 1979, KLR, 154.*
6. Republic vs. Edward Kirui, *High Court of Kenya (Nairobi) Criminal Case No. 9 of 2008; [2010] eKLR*
7. Republic vs. Ooko, *High Court Criminal Case No. 1159 of 1966 (unreported)*
8. Republic vs. Stephen Kiprotich Leting & 3 Others, *High Court of Kenya (Nakuru) Criminal Case No. 34 of 2008; [2009] eKLR*
9. Wangari Maathai vs. Kenya Times Media Trust, *High Court Civil Case No. 5403 of 1989, (11989) KLR 267*

LIST OF CONVENTIONS AND OTHER INTERNATIONAL LEGAL INSTRUMENTS

1. Agreement between the UN and the Government of the Republic of Sierra Leone on the Establishment of a Special Court for Sierra Leone, January 16, 2002; *S.C. Res. 246, UNSC OR, 57th Sess.; UN Doc. S/2002/246.*
2. Agreement Between the United Nations and the Royal Government of Cambodia Concerning the Prosecution of Crimes Committed During the Period of Democratic Kampuchea; *UN. Doc. A/57/806(2003).*
3. Charter of the International Military Tribunal; *82 UNTS 279.*
4. Charter of the United Nations, signed on 26 June 1945, in San Francisco, at the conclusion of the United Nations Conference on International Organization; *59 Stat. 1031; T.S. No. 993; 3 Bevans 1153.*
5. Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide; New York, 9 December 1948; *78 UNTS 277.*
6. International Convention on the Suppression and Punishment of the Crime of Apartheid; *1015 UNTS 243; U.N. Doc. A/9030 (1974).*
7. Statute of the International Criminal Court; *UN. Doc. A/CONF. 183/9 (1998); ILM 1002 (1998); 2187 UNTS 90.*