







GENOME NOTE

REVISED Draft genome sequences of three emerging beta-lactamase-producing *Escherichia coli* in the camel production system in Northern Kenya [version 2; peer review: 2 approved]Rachael Gachogo ^{1,2}, Irene Karegi ^{3,4}, Brian Ogoti ⁵, Victor Musyoki⁶, Dino Martins⁷, Frank Onyambu ^{1,8}, Joseph Kamau³¹Center for Molecular Biosciences and Genomics, Nairobi, Kenya²Division of immunology, Department of Human Pathology, University of Cape Town, Cape Town, South Africa³One Health Center, Institute of Primate Research, Nairobi, Kenya⁴Department of Biochemistry, Jomo Kenyatta University of Agriculture and Technology, Juja, Kenya⁵Center for Microbiology, Washington State University, Nairobi, Kenya⁶Department of Medical Microbiology, University of Nairobi, Nairobi, Kenya⁷Mpala Research Center, Nanyuki, Kenya⁸Meru University of Science and Technology, Meru, Kenya**V2** First published: 30 Nov 2022, 11:1413
<https://doi.org/10.12688/f1000research.127990.1>Latest published: 16 May 2023, 11:1413
<https://doi.org/10.12688/f1000research.127990.2>**Abstract**

We report the draft genome sequences and annotation of three beta-lactamase-producing *Escherichia coli* (*E.coli*) strains isolated from fecal samples of healthy camels in Laikipia county, Kenya. This data adds to the online genome resources to support the ongoing antimicrobial resistance surveillance in the livestock-wildlife interface.





Keywords


E.coli, beta-lactamase, AMR, genome, whole genome sequencing, camel



This article is included in the **Genomics and Genetics** gateway.

Open Peer Review**Approval Status** 

	1	2
version 2 (revision) 16 May 2023	 view	
		
version 1 30 Nov 2022	 view	 view

1. **Meenakshi S. Iyer** , Tata Institute of Fundamental Research, Bengaluru, India2. **Janet Midoga** , KEMRI-Wellcome Trust Research Programme, Kilifi, Kenya

Any reports and responses or comments on the article can be found at the end of the article.

Corresponding authors: Rachael Gachogo (rwanja8@gmail.com), Frank Onyambu (frank.onyambu@iscb.org)

Author roles: **Gachogo R:** Data Curation, Formal Analysis, Writing – Original Draft Preparation; **Karegi I:** Methodology, Writing – Review & Editing; **Ogoti B:** Data Curation, Formal Analysis, Methodology; **Musyoki V:** Data Curation, Methodology; **Martins D:** Project Administration, Resources; **Onyambu F:** Conceptualization, Funding Acquisition, Resources, Supervision, Writing – Review & Editing; **Kamau J:** Project Administration, Supervision, Writing – Review & Editing

Competing interests: No competing interests were disclosed.

Grant information: The author(s) declared that no grants were involved in supporting this work.

Copyright: © 2023 Gachogo R *et al.* This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

How to cite this article: Gachogo R, Karegi I, Ogoti B *et al.* **Draft genome sequences of three emerging beta-lactamase-producing *Escherichia coli* in the camel production system in Northern Kenya [version 2; peer review: 2 approved]** F1000Research 2023, **11**:1413 <https://doi.org/10.12688/f1000research.127990.2>

First published: 30 Nov 2022, **11**:1413 <https://doi.org/10.12688/f1000research.127990.1>

REVISED Amendments from Version 1

This version highlights the rationale of sequencing *E. coli* in camels. This version contains a table showing antibiotics susceptibility and beta-lactamase genes profile of the isolates sequenced.

Any further responses from the reviewers can be found at the end of the article

Introduction

Antimicrobial resistance (AMR), especially on the readily available beta-lactam antibiotics continues to threaten effective healthcare management and global economic success in livestock farming (Fashae et al., 2021; Kiiru et al., 2012). Recently, concerted efforts have been employed to explore the AMR situation following a One Health Approach. Previously, we and others have demonstrated an increased occurrence of broad-spectrum producing *Enterobacteriaceae* in livestock (Akunda et al., 2023; Nüesch-Inderbinen et al., 2020). Importantly, extended-spectrum beta-lactamase (ESBL) producing *Enterobacteriaceae* have been implicated in the development of multi-drug resistance in both humans and animals. However, there still exists a gap in whole genome sequencing data on *Enterobacteriaceae* harboring AMR genes in camels (*Camelus dromedaries*), a key component of livestock farming in arid and semi-arid regions of Northern Kenya. We therefore aimed at sequencing the genomes of extended-spectrum beta lactamase *Enterobacteriaceae* using *Escherichia coli* (*E. coli*) as our model organism.

Methods

Here, we report three draft genome sequences of beta-lactamase-producing *E. coli* isolated from camel fecal samples in Laikipia county, Northern Kenya as previously described (Akunda et al., 2023). Fecal samples were collected from healthy camels reared under both ranching systems and pastoralism, transported in Cary Blair media (HiMedia Lab, Mumbai, India) and stored at 4°C awaiting processing.

The samples were cultured on MacConkey agar plate (HiMedia Lab, Mumbai, India) and incubated at 37°C for 18 hours. A single colony per MacConkey agar plate that displayed *E. coli* traits morphologically was identified through Gram staining and the IMViC (indol, methyl red, Voges Proskauer, and citrate) biochemical method and subjected to antimicrobial susceptibility testing (AST) against the beta-lactam antibiotic spectrum. Briefly, antimicrobial susceptibility testing (AST) was performed on Mueller Hinton agar (HiMedia Lab, Mumbai, India) using Kirby Bauer disk diffusion method. Antibiotics tested included, Ampicillin-10 µg (AMP), Chloramphenicol-30 µg (CHL), Tetracycline-30 µg (TCY), Gentamycin-10 µg (GEN), Streptomycin-10 µg (STR1), Trimethoprim-sulfamethoxazole-25 µg (SXT), Norfloxacin-10 µg (NOR), Ciprofloxacin-5 µg (CIP), Cefaclor-30 µg (CEC), Ceftriaxone-30 µg (CRO), Cefotaxime-30 µg (CTX), Cefuroxime-30 µg (CXM), Cefepime-30 µg (FEP), Amoxicillin–Clavulanate-20/10 µg (AMC), and Ceftazidime-30 µg (CAZ). The antibiotic susceptibility profile of the sequenced isolates is as shown in Table 1.

Production of beta-lactamase genes was assessed by conducting PCR to confirm genes encoding for CTX-M, TEM, CMY, SHV and OXA for the resistant isolates (Livermore et al., 2007), results are as shown in Table 1. Briefly, a 20 µl PCR reaction was prepared by adding 10 µl of the Platinum II Hot-Start PCR Master Mix (Invitrogen, Carlsbad, CA, U.S), 0.4 µl of 10 nmol of forward and reverse primers, 4 µl of Platinum GC enhancer, 0.2 µl nuclease free water and 5 µl DNA. Cycling was performed on Veriti™ Dx 96-well Thermal Cycler (ThermoFisher, Waltham, Massachusetts, U.S) using

Table 1. Antibiotic sensitivity profile and beta-lactamase genes profile (+) present, (-) absent.

	<i>E. coli</i> (IPR_LC 17)	<i>E. coli</i> (IPR_LC19)	<i>E. coli</i> (IPR_LC20)
Livestock production System	Intensive	Extensive	Intensive
Antibiotic sensitivity profile	AMC, CAZ, CTX, CXM, CEC, CHL, TCY	AMC, CAZ, CTX, CRO, CXM, FEP, CEC, SXT	AMC, CAZ, CTX, CRO, CXM, FEP, CEC, TCY
CTX-M	+	+	+
TEM	+	+	+
SHV	-	-	-
OXA	-	-	-

Table 2. Primers used for detection of blaTEM, blaCTX-M, blaCMY, blaOXA, and blaSHV gene(s) minutes (min), Seconds (sec), base pairs (bp).

Primers	Oligonucleotide Sequence (5'-3')	Annealing Temperature	PCR conditions	Product Size (bp)
TEM	F-ATGAGTATTCAACATTTCCG R-CTGACAGTTACCAATGCTTA	55°C	94°C: 2 min 94°C: 15 Sec X35	840
SHV	F-GGTTATGCGTTATATTCGCC R-TTAGCGTTGCCAGTGCTC	50°C	Annealing Temperature: 15 Sec X35	854
CTX-M	F-ATGTGCAGYACCAGTAARGT R-TGGGTRAARTARGTSACCAGA	60°C	68°C:15 Sec X35 4°C:10 min	593
CMY	F-ATGATGAAAAAATCGTTATGC R-TTGCAGCTTTTCAAGAATGCGC	55°C		1200
OXA	F-TCAACTTTCAAGATCGCA R-GTGTGTTTGAATGGTGA	62°C		820

primers and PCR conditions as in Table 2. The respective gene fragment sizes were confirmed in 1% agarose gel (Invitrogen, Carlsbad, CA, U.S). ESBL producing *E. coli* isolates were phenotypically confirmed using double-disc synergy test (DDST) (Drieux *et al.*, 2008).

Genomic DNA of the confirmed ESBL producing *E. coli* isolates was extracted using Isolate II Genomic DNA Kit (Bioline, UK) and sequencing performed using Oxford Nanopore Technologies (ONT, Oxford, UK). Briefly, the manufacturer's sample barcodes (Native Barcoding Expansion 1-12) (EXP-NBD104) and sequencing adapters (Ligation Sequencing kit) (SQK-LSK109)) were added following kit instructions. Sequencing was performed on MinION device using R9.4.1 flow cell to generate 186, 38153, and 31152 raw reads for the *E. coli* strains IPR_LC17, IPR_LC19 and IPR_LC20, respectively. Basecalling and demultiplexing of raw reads were performed using Guppy v3.6.1 (<https://nanoporetech.com>). Adaptors were trimmed using PORECHOP v0.2.4 (Wick *et al.*, 2017) and poor quality reads, less than 500 bp and with an average quality score of below 10 were removed using NANOFLIT v2.8.0 (De Coster *et al.*, 2018).

E. coli PR_LC17 genome was assembled using Canu v2.2 (Koren *et al.*, 2017) while *E. coli* (IPR_LC19) and *E. coli* (IPR_LC20) were assembled using Flye v2.9.1 (Kolmogorov *et al.*, 2019). The taxonomy of the organism was confirmed using public databases for molecular typing and microbial genome diversity (PubMLST) (Jolley *et al.*, 2018). Quality of the assembled genomes was assessed using QUAST v5.1.0 (Gurevich *et al.*, 2013) and annotated using NCBI's PGAP (Tatusova *et al.*, 2016). The assembly metrics and annotation summaries are as shown in Table 3.

Table 3. PGAP genome annotation of *E. coli* (IPR_LC17, IPR_LC19 & IPR_LC20 strains).

Feature	<i>E. coli</i> (IPR_LC17)	<i>E. coli</i> (IPR_LC19)	<i>E. coli</i> (IPR_LC20)
Genome size (Mbp)	5.08	4.70	5.66
GC content (%)	50.76	51.00	50.52
Sequencing coverage (X)	33	18	10
No. of contigs	2	2	13
Genome fraction (%)	74.07	72.62	78.97
N ₅₀ (bp)	4,984,001	4,606,403	4, 015,521
Genes (total)	5398	4849	6491
CDSs (total)	5277	4730	6367
Genes (coding)	1409	1604	2115
Pseudo Genes	3868	3126	4252
rRNAs	22	22	22
tRNAs	89	85	92
ncRNAs	10	12	10
CRISPR sequences	0	0	1

Ethical considerations

The project was approved by Institute of Primate Research (IPR) review committee (ISERC/10/2020).

Data availability

Underlying data

IPR_LC20

Genbank: Escherichia coli strain IPR_LC20, whole genome shotgun sequencing project, Accession number JAOZE000000000: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/nucleotide/JAOZE000000000.1/>

Sequence Read Archive (SRA): Oxford Nanopore Reads of Escherichia coli in camel production systems in Northern Kenya, Accession number SRR21998714: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/sra/SRR21998714>

IPR_LC19

Genbank: Escherichia coli strain IPR_LC19, whole genome shotgun sequencing project, Accession number JAOZFA000000000: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/nucleotide/JAOZFA000000000.1/>

Sequence Read Archive (SRA): Oxford Nanopore Reads of Escherichia coli in camel production systems in Northern Kenya, Accession number SRR21998715: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/sra/SRR21998715>

IPR_LC17

Genbank: Escherichia coli strain IPR_LC17, whole genome shotgun sequencing project, Accession number JAOZFB000000000: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/nucleotide/JAOZFB000000000.1/>

Sequence Read Archive (SRA): Oxford Nanopore Reads of Escherichia coli in camel production systems in Northern Kenya, Accession number SRR21998716: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/sra/SRR21998716>

References

- Akunda IK, Kariuki DW, Matulis G, *et al.*: **Antimicrobial resistance patterns and characterisation of emerging beta-lactamase-producing Escherichia coli in camels sampled from Northern Kenya.** *Vet. Med. Sci.* 2023; 1–10.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)
- De Coster W, D'Hert S, Schultz DT, *et al.*: **NanoPack: Visualizing and processing long-read sequencing data.** *Bioinformatics.* 2018; 34(15): 2666–2669.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)
- Drieux L, Brossier F, Sougakoff W, *et al.*: **Phenotypic detection of extended-spectrum β -lactamase production in Enterobacteriaceae: Review and bench guide.** *Clin. Microbiol. Infect.* 2008; 14(SUPPL. 1), 90–103.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)
- Fashae K, Engelmann I, Monecke S, *et al.*: **Molecular characterisation of extended-spectrum β -lactamase producing Escherichia coli in wild birds and cattle, Ibadan, Nigeria.** *BMC Vet. Res.* 2021; 17(1): 12–33.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)
- Gurevich A, Saveliev V, Vyahhi N, *et al.*: **QUAST: Quality assessment tool for genome assemblies.** *Bioinformatics.* 2013; 29(8): 1072–1075.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)
- Jolley KA, Bray JE, Maiden MCJ: **Open-access bacterial population genomics: BIGSdb software, the PubMLST.org website and their applications [version 1; referees: 2 approved].** *Wellcome Open Research.* 2018; 3: 1–20.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)
- Kiiru J, Kariuki S, Goddeeris BM, *et al.*: **Analysis of -lactamase phenotypes and carriage of selected -lactamase genes among Escherichia coli strains obtained from Kenyan patients during an 18-year period.** *BMC Microbiol.* 2012; 12(1): 1.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)
- Kolmogorov M, Yuan J, Lin Y, *et al.*: **Assembly of long, error-prone reads using repeat graphs.** *Nat. Biotechnol.* 2019; 37(5): 540–546.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)
- Koren S, Walenz BP, Berlin K, *et al.*: **Canu: Scalable and accurate long-read assembly via adaptive k -mer weighting and repeat separation.** *Genome Res.* 2017; 27(5): 722–736.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)
- Livermore DM, Canton R, Gniadkowski M, *et al.*: **CTX-M: Changing the face of ESBLs in Europe.** *J. Antimicrob. Chemother.* 2007; 59(2): 165–174.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)
- Nüesch-Inderbilen M, Kindle P, Baschera M, *et al.*: **Antimicrobial resistant and extended-spectrum β -lactamase (ESBL) producing Escherichia coli isolated from fecal samples of African dromedary camels.** *Sci. Afr.* 2020; 7: e00274.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#) | [Free Full Text](#)
- Tatusova T, Dicuccio M, Badretdin A, *et al.*: **NCBI prokaryotic genome annotation pipeline.** *Nucleic Acids Res.* 2016; 44(14): 6614–6624.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)
- Wick RR, Judd LM, Gorrie CL, *et al.*: **Completing bacterial genome assemblies with multiplex MinION sequencing.** *Microbial Genomics.* 2017; 3(10): e000132.
[Publisher Full Text](#)

Open Peer Review

Current Peer Review Status:  

Version 2

Reviewer Report 29 August 2023

<https://doi.org/10.5256/f1000research.147722.r173957>

© 2023 Iyer M. This is an open access peer review report distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.



Meenakshi S. Iyer 

National Centre for Biological Sciences, Tata Institute of Fundamental Research, Bengaluru, India

I have gone through the revised version of the manuscript. Most of the suggested changes have been addressed. I approve this version of the manuscript.

Competing Interests: No competing interests were disclosed.

Reviewer Expertise: Genomics, Transcriptomics, Anti-microbial resistance, Protein sequence-structure-function relationships, Database and algorithm development, Big-data analysis

I confirm that I have read this submission and believe that I have an appropriate level of expertise to confirm that it is of an acceptable scientific standard.

Version 1

Reviewer Report 02 March 2023

<https://doi.org/10.5256/f1000research.140538.r162944>

© 2023 Midega J. This is an open access peer review report distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.



Janet Midega 

KEMRI-Wellcome Trust Research Programme, Kilifi, Kenya

The authors provide details of a study in which beta lactamase producing Ecoli from fecal samples are sequenced from Camels in Northern Kenya. Whilst this is an important study given the close

interactions between human and camels in this part of Kenya, hence the likelihood of Animal to human transmission of beta lactamase producing E coli, It might help if the authors can write down a justification for why the study was conducted.

Why was there a focus on beta-lactamase producing E coli only? For example is it the most important isolate in this (human and camel) population?

In total how many camels are represented in the study or were these random fecal samples?

Is it possible to be more precise about the location, for example provide GPS co-ordinates of the sampling locations - A county is a very wide area.

Are the rationale for sequencing the genome and the species significance clearly described?

Partly

Are the protocols appropriate and is the work technically sound?

Yes

Are sufficient details of the sequencing and extraction, software used, and materials provided to allow replication by others?

Yes

Are the datasets clearly presented in a usable and accessible format, and the assembly and annotation available in an appropriate subject-specific repository?

Yes

Competing Interests: No competing interests were disclosed.

Reviewer Expertise: Genomic epidemiology, Microbiology

I confirm that I have read this submission and believe that I have an appropriate level of expertise to confirm that it is of an acceptable scientific standard.

Reviewer Report 04 January 2023

<https://doi.org/10.5256/f1000research.140538.r157281>

© 2023 Iyer M. This is an open access peer review report distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.



Meenakshi S. Iyer

National Centre for Biological Sciences, Tata Institute of Fundamental Research, Bengaluru, India

In this manuscript the authors present a genome sequences of three *E. coli* strains isolated from camels in Northern Kenya. The importance of studying drug-resistant bacteria from livestock is

obvious and these sequences are of course a very useful resource for the community. However I have a request for minor revisions. I found that the paper needs to address a few more points:

1. The authors need to provide more background on the need for sequencing *E. coli* samples from camel populations. There are some recent studies on beta-lactamase producing isolates from camels and other populations from Kenya. These studies (and more) can be referenced: Karegi I et al., 2022 DOI:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijid.2021.12.018>; Anyanwu MU et al., 2012 <https://doi.org/10.1155/2021/6630379>; and Nueesch-Inderbinnen M et al., 2020 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sciaf.2020.e00274>.
2. The results can be recorded in a separate section. Table 2 on genome annotation statistics can be moved to this section.
3. The results for the antibiotic susceptibility testing for the three isolates can be provided as a separate table.
4. The results of the PCR reactions for the 3 isolates describing which plasmids were detected from the samples need to be provided. These results can be corroborated with existing literature on the beta-lactamase encoding plasmid prevalence in Africa.
5. In Table 2, the statistics for partial genes detected in each strain can be listed. Overall, the authors can comment on the draft nature of the genome in the results section (% completeness, number of contigs etc.).

References

1. Karegi I, Maina B, Mohammed H, Kwallah A, et al.: Antimicrobial Resistance Profile and Characterization of ESBLs in Escherichia coli from Camels in Northern Kenya. *International Journal of Infectious Diseases*. 2022; **116**: S7-S8 [Publisher Full Text](#)
2. Anyanwu MU, Okpala COR, Chah KF, Shoyinka VS: Prevalence and Traits of Mobile Colistin Resistance Gene Harbouring Isolates from Different Ecosystems in Africa. *Biomed Res Int*. 2021; **2021**: 6630379 [PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)
3. Nüesch-Inderbinnen M, Kindle P, Baschera M, Liljander A, et al.: Antimicrobial resistant and extended-spectrum β -lactamase (ESBL) producing Escherichia coli isolated from fecal samples of African dromedary camels. *Sci Afr*. 2020; **7**: e00274 [PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)

Are the rationale for sequencing the genome and the species significance clearly described?

Partly

Are the protocols appropriate and is the work technically sound?

Yes

Are sufficient details of the sequencing and extraction, software used, and materials provided to allow replication by others?

Yes

Are the datasets clearly presented in a usable and accessible format, and the assembly and annotation available in an appropriate subject-specific repository?

Yes

Competing Interests: No competing interests were disclosed.

Reviewer Expertise: Genomics, Transcriptomics, Anti-microbial resistance, Protein sequence-structure-function relationships, Database and algorithm development, Big-data analysis

I confirm that I have read this submission and believe that I have an appropriate level of expertise to confirm that it is of an acceptable scientific standard, however I have significant reservations, as outlined above.

The benefits of publishing with F1000Research:

- Your article is published within days, with no editorial bias
- You can publish traditional articles, null/negative results, case reports, data notes and more
- The peer review process is transparent and collaborative
- Your article is indexed in PubMed after passing peer review
- Dedicated customer support at every stage

For pre-submission enquiries, contact research@f1000.com

F1000Research