Tips on how to review a paper presented for publication

Dr. Jefitha Karimirio

COECSA Scientific meeting

Kigali 21.08.2013
Understand the goal and the process

• We are in a competitive environment, looking for quality articles to attract scientific authors/readers (visibility)

• JOECSA is a young journal (editors and reviewers on the learning curve) hence reviewers to assist to edit articles

• Ideally, articles should be screened by the editorial team for relevance and compliance with guidelines before peer review

• An article should be reviewed by at least 2 peers (ping-pong) to ensure quality and minimize conflict of interest/bias

• Editors verifies finalized articles and groups them into a journal
What to look in regard to quality

- **Importance**: journal articles are addressed to peers who are interested in contemporary topics

- **Originality/substantial contribution to knowledge**: new evidence, method/approach or combinations of both

- **Prose and clarity**: writing style/language/presentation

- **Learning opportunity on and important topic**: for example invited review articles
Compliance with journal standards

- Does the article comply with the journal format/structure? IMRAD is the standard structure for scientific journals.
- Is there consent to publish data, photos and materials from other sources.
- Have the authors given due recognition to previous studies. Is there evidence of cheating/plagiarism?
- If you note gross violations, stop review and alert the Editor in Chief for further directions.
Review of specifics paragraphs (plenary discussion)

• Title:

• Introduction:

• Methods:

• Results:

• Discussion: What about the opening sentence and the concluding statement?

ALWAYS ASK: HOW DOES THIS RELATE TO THE OBJECTIVE?